Islamic and Jewish dietary laws compared

From Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

(Redirected from <u>Comparison of Dhabi•a Halal and kashrut</u>) Jump to: <u>navigation</u>, <u>search</u>



It has been suggested that this article or section be <u>merged</u> into <u>*Ritual slaughter*</u>. (<u>Discuss</u>)

The Islamic dietary laws (*Dhabiha Halaal*) and the Jewish dietary laws (*Kashrut*) are both quite detailed, and contain both points of similarity and discord. They share a common root: a code of laws found in Leviticus and recapitulated in the Quran.

Contents

[hide]

- <u>1 Substance classification</u>
 - o <u>1.1 Similarities</u>
 - o <u>1.2 Differences</u>
- <u>2 Slaughter</u>
 - o 2.1 Similarities
 - o <u>2.2 Differences</u>
- <u>3 Miscellaneous comparisons</u>
 - o <u>3.1 Similarities</u>
 - o <u>3.2 Differences</u>
- <u>4 See also</u>
- <u>5 Notes</u>

Islamic Jurisprudence – a discipline of Islamic studies Fields • Economical • Political • Marital • Etiquette

- Theological
- Hygiene

Part of a series on the

- o Islamic cleanliness
 - <u>Ihram</u>
 - Wudu
 - <u>Ghusl</u>
 - <u>Tayammum</u>
 - <u>Miswak</u>
 - <u>Najis</u>
 - <u>Sexual Hygiene</u>
- o Dietary laws
 - <u>Dhabi•a</u> Slaughter
 - <u>Banned Slaughtering</u>
 - of animals
 - Comparison to kashrut
- o <u>Toilet Etiquette</u>
- Military

This box: <u>view</u> • <u>talk</u> • <u>edit</u>

[edit] Substance classification

[edit] Similarities

- Blood and <u>swine</u> are prohibited in kashrut and dhabi•a halal. [1][2]
- Many animals permitted in kashrut are also dhabi•a halal, such as bovines. [3][4]
- Kashrut and dhabi•a halal guidelines both generally forbid the consumption of <u>amphibian</u>

```
animals such as frogs. [5]
```

- According to kashrut, almost all insects are not kosher. The few kosher insects are specific types of <u>locusts</u> and <u>grasshoppers</u> which are seldom eaten today. [6] It is also a consensus among Muslim scholars that most insects are forbidden except for locusts [7] [8].
- Kashrut states that kosher aquatic animals must have scales and fins. The most prevalent consensus among Muslim scholars is that in order to be dhabi•a halal, the fish must have scales (nothing is said about fins).[9][10] However, according to Jewish oral law all fish that have scales have fins, thus making all fish with scales kosher and thus the law being essentially the same dhabi•a halal [11] [12] [13].

[edit] Differences

- For a substance to be dhabi•a halal, it must not contain <u>alcohol</u> of any kind (except what occurs naturally, as in the case of fruits). The strictness of this with regard to the presence of extremely small quantities of alcohol in cooked foods depends largely on individual commitment. Except for grape wine and grape juice (which must be manufactured under Jewish supervision), Kashrut allows any sort of alcohol, as long as it has no non-kosher ingredients (including any unsupervised grape extracts).[14][15]
- The list of animals forbidden by kashrut is more restrictive, as kashrut requires that, to be kosher, mammals must chew cud as well as have cloven hooves. Dhabi•a halal does not require that an animal have cloven hooves. Thus, various animals such as the <u>camel</u> are permissible as per dhabi•a halal, but not according to kashrut.[16][17]
- Unless prepared according to a special process, the hindquarters of <u>cows</u>, <u>sheep</u>, <u>goats</u>, and other ruminants are not generally considered kosher. Dhabi•a halal contains no such restriction regarding the hindquarters.
 [18]



Islamic and Jewish dietary laws compared - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

• Kashrut prohibits shellfish such as <u>lobster</u>, <u>shrimp</u>, <u>clams</u>, and <u>oysters[19]</u>, while there is debate among Muslim scholars regarding the status of <u>shellfish</u>.

[edit] Slaughter

<u>Dhabi•a</u> is the method used to slaughter an animal as per Islamic tradition. <u>Shechita</u> is the ritual slaughter of mammals and birds according to Jewish law.

[edit] Similarities

- Both, shechita and dhabi•a, involve cutting across the neck of the animal with a non-serrated blade in one clean attempt in order to sever the main vessels.[20][21]
- Both require that the spinal cord be avoided during slaughter.[22][23]
- Both require draining the blood of the animal.[24][25]
- Any adult, sane Jew who knows the proper technique can perform shechita [Maimonides' Code, Laws of Shechita 2:12]. Similarly, Dhabi•a, can be performed by any "adult sane Muslim...by following the rules prescribed by <u>Shariah</u>"[26]. Some Islamic authorities,

Jacob/Israel · Rachel · Leah · Moses Deborah · Ruth · Solomon · David Hillel · <u>Shammai</u> · <u>Rabbi Akiva</u> · <u>Judah the Prince</u> Rav · Saadia Gaon · Rif · Rashi · Tosafists Maimonides · Nahmanides · Yosef Karo Jewish life cycle Brit · Bar/Bat Mitzvah · Shidduch · Marriage Niddah · Naming · Pidyon HaBen · Bereavement **Religious roles** Rabbi · Rebbe · Hazzan Kohen/Priest · Mashgiach · Gabbai · Maggid Mohel · Beth din · Rosh yeshiva **Religious buildings** Synagogue · Mikvah · Holy Temple / Tabernacle **Religious articles** Tallit · Tefillin · Kipa · Sefer Torah Tzitzit · Mezuzah · Menorah · Hanukiah · Shofar 4 Species · Kittel · Gartel · Yad Jewish prayers and services Shema · Amidah · Aleinu · Kol Nidre Kaddish · Hallel · Ma Tovu · Havdalah Judaism & other religions Christianity · Islam · "Judeo-Christian" · Others Abrahamic faiths · Judeo-Paganism · Pluralism **Related topics** Antisemitism · Criticism Philo-Semitism · Yeshiva · Zionism $\underline{\mathbf{v}} \cdot \underline{\mathbf{d}} \cdot \underline{\mathbf{e}}$

Abraham · Sarah · Isaac · Rebecca ·

though, state that dhabi•a can also be performed by Jews and Christians [27]

[edit] Differences

- The actual requirements of the slaughter in terms of which vessels must be severed and which must be kept intact are different. Shechita requires that the "trachea, (esophagus), the carotid arteries and jugular veins" be severed[28]. There is no conclusive answer as to exactly which vessels are required to be severed as per dhabi•a but according to the Islamic rules, the two big veins on both sides of the neck should be severed, but it is agreed that "most of the four veins" must be severed[29].
- Today, as a matter of practicality, Shechita is only performed by a licensed, well-trained slaughterman known as a *shochet*[30]. (While no rule specifies the gender of a *shochet*, they

traditionally have been male)^[1]. While dhabi•a slaughter is generally performed by an experienced individual, it is still common in certain parts of the world for families to butcher their own meats.

- *Theoretically*, in the unlikely event that a minor or insane Jew slaughters an animal, the Shechita would be considered valid after-the-fact if the proper technique was used [Maimonides 2:12 and commentaries ad loc]. The strictness of Dhabi•a's requirement regarding an "adult, sane" slaughterer is under debate in an identical situation, because there is no primary Islamic source which addresses this specific scenario [31]. However, this is unlikely to occur, and so does not constitute a major difference.
- Dhabiha requires that God's (see Islamic Concept of God) name be pronounced before each slaughter [32]. Some Muslims have accorded meat to be halal but not necessarily dhabiha i.e Kosher meat is considered halal by Muslims and meat slaughtered by Christians. This is according to the Hadith: "it is narrated by Al Bukhari from Aisha the Prophet Muhammad's wife, that some people came to him and said, Oh God's Prophet, some people bring us meat and we do not know if they pronounced the name of God on it or not, and he said pronounce you the name of God and eat." This hadith is taken to give permission to eat non-dhabiha meat but with the condition to say God's name before eating. Dhabiha meat by definition is meat that is slaughtered in the shariah manner and the name of God is said before the slaughter. In Shechita, a blessing to God is recited before beginning an uninterrupted period of slaughtering; as long as the Shochet does not have a lengthy pause, interrupt, or otherwise lose concentration, this blessing covers all the animals slaughtered that period. This blessing follows the standard form for a blessing before most Jewish rituals ("Blesséd are you God ... who commanded us regarding [such-and-such]," in this case, Shechita). The general rule in Judaism is that for rituals which have an associated blessing, if one omitted the blessing, the ritual is still valid [see Maimonides Laws of Blessings 11:5]; as such, even if the *shochet* failed to recite the blessing before Shechita, the slaughter is still valid and the meat is kosher. [Maimonides Laws of Slaughter 1:2 and commentaries ad loc]

[edit] Miscellaneous comparisons

[edit] Similarities

- After slaughter, both require that the animal be examined to ensure that it is fit for consumption. Dhabi•a guidelines generally say that the carcass should be inspected [33], while kashrut says that the animal's internal organs must be examined "to make certain the animal was not diseased"[34].
- Both sets of religious rules are subject to arguments among different authorities with regional and sect-related differences in permissible foodstuffs.
- Strictly observant followers of either religion will not eat in restaurants not certified to follow its rules.

[edit] Differences

• During <u>Passover</u>, there is an additional set of restrictions, requiring that no <u>chametz</u> (<u>leavened</u>

bread) be eaten. This has no parallel in the laws of dhabi•a halal.[35]

- Kashrut prohibits mixing meat and dairy, which may not be consumed or prepared together. Dhabi•a halal has no such rules. [36]
- In Judaism, the permissibility of food accompanies a vast corpus of secondary factors. For instance, vessels and implements used to cook food must also be kept separate for dairy products and meat products. If a vessel or implement used to cook dairy is then used to cook meat, in addition to the thus contaminated food becoming non-kosher (according to various situation-specific rules), the vessel or implement itself can no longer be used for the preparation or consumption of a kosher meal. Depending on the material properties of the item, it may be rendered permissible ("kashered") by certain procedures or it may be irretrievably contaminated. In general, the same policy extends to any apparatus used in the preparation of foods, such as an ovens or stovetop. Laws are somewhat more lenient for modern cooking apparatuses like microwaves, although this depends greatly on tradition (minhag) or individuals' own stringent practices (*chumrot*). As a result of these factors, many Conservative and Orthodox Jews cannot eat dishes prepared at any restaurant that is not specifically kosher, even if the actual dish ordered uses only kosher ingredients. This level of stringency does not have an analog in Dhabiha Halal.

[edit] See also

• Bans on ritual slaughter

[edit] Notes

1. <u>^ Shulchan Aruch Yoreh Deah 1:1 gloss</u>

Retrieved from "http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Islamic_and_Jewish_dietary_laws_compared"

Categories: Articles to be merged since October 2007 | All articles with unsourced statements | Articles with unsourced statements since February 2007 | Articles with unsourced statements since June 2007 | Judeo-Islamic topics | Kosher food | Halaal food | Traditional meat processing

Views

- <u>Article</u>
- Discussion
- Edit this page
- <u>History</u>

Personal tools

Islamic and Jewish dietary laws compared - Wikipedia, the free encyclopedia

• Log in / create account

Navigation

- Main Page
- <u>Contents</u>
- Featured content
- <u>Current events</u>
- Random article

Interaction

- About Wikipedia
- Community portal
- <u>Recent changes</u>
- Contact Wikipedia
- Donate to Wikipedia
- <u>Help</u>

Search

Toolbox

- What links here
- <u>Related changes</u>
- <u>Upload file</u>
- Special pages
- <u>Printable version</u>
- Permanent link
- <u>Cite this page</u>



• This page was last modified 00:14, 20 December 2007.

All text is available under the terms of the <u>GNU Free Documentation License</u>. (See <u>Copyrights</u> for details.)
 Wikipedia® is a registered trademark of the <u>Wikimedia Foundation, Inc</u>., a U.S. registered <u>501(c)</u>

(3) tax-deductible nonprofit charity.

- <u>Privacy policy</u>
- About Wikipedia
- **Disclaimers**