# EARLY CARE AND EDUCATION (ECE) INTERVENTIONS FOR PROMOTING NUTRITION AND PHYSICAL ACTIVITY & PREVENTING OBESITY



Kelly Blondin Dania Orta-Aleman Gail Woodward-Lopez

Principal Investigator: Patricia Crawford

This literature review was supported with funding from the Nutrition and Obesity Prevention Branch of the California Department of Public Health (NEOPB-CDPH) as part of their Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Education Program (SNAP-Ed) with funds from United States Department of Agriculture. (USDA). These institutions are equal opportunity providers and employers. The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of CDPH or USDA.

# **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Introduction:** In an era of great concern over children's rates of overweight and obesity, policy makers and public health professionals recognize the potential utility of the Early Care and Education (ECE) setting for improving children's nutrition, physical activity, and weight status. It is critical to reach children in this age group because lifelong habits are formed early in life and many young children already have obesity or are at risk prior to entering kindergarten. ECE is one of the few settings where larger percentages of preschool-age children can be reached.

Obesity prevention interventions in ECE have been implemented in varied facilities (e.g., child care centers, Head Start sites, preschools, family child care homes) throughout the U.S. This includes interventions designed to help facilities meet new standards enacted by the U.S. Department of Agriculture (USDA) governing foods and beverages offered to children at sites that participate in the USDA Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP). These interventions reach many young children, and while their potential influence is great and a variety of specific interventions have been reported in the literature, detailed understanding of their comparative impacts has not been available to practitioners who seek to develop and implement the most effective interventions. Given the importance of this setting, the Nutrition Education and Obesity Prevention Branch of the California Department of Public Health (NEOPB-CDPH), a state implementing agency for the Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Education Program (SNAP-Ed) in California asked the Nutrition Policy Institute (NPI) to conduct a literature review to identify effective interventions for reducing obesity and improving nutrition and physical activity to inform their SNAP-Ed funded work in the ECE setting.

Methods: The authors conducted a review of the peer-reviewed literature published in upper-middle and high-income countries from January 1, 1998 to October 26, 2016 on ECE-based interventions for nutrition and physical activity promotion and obesity prevention. A total of 65 primary studies describing 70 interventions in a variety of ECE sites (including centers and family child care homes) met criteria for inclusion in this report. Inclusion criteria included intervention setting, study design, nature of the intervention, and outcome measures. Intervention effectiveness was evaluated according to impact on outcomes aligned with California's statewide objectives for SNAP-Ed, including nutrition (changes in consumption patterns), physical activity (changes in physical activity of various intensities), and weight status (changes in BMI, skinfold thickness, percent body fat, waist circumference, prevalence of overweight/obesity.)

**Results:** Of the 70 ECE interventions reviewed, 44 had at least one nutrition component and 51 had at least one physical activity (PA) component; 68 evaluations measured at least one outcome aligned with a CA SNAP-Ed objective; 44/68 (65%) were effective for any CA SNAP-Ed objective-related outcome; 20/40 interventions (50%) that measured a PA outcome were associated with a statistically significant increase in PA; 16/36 (44%) interventions that measured a body weight/composition-related outcome were associated with a statistically significant decrease in weight or improvement in body composition (BMI, waist circumference, skinfold, % body fat); 12/19 (63%) interventions that measured fruit and/or vegetable consumption showed a statistically significant increase in fruit and/or vegetable consumption;

2/8 (25%) interventions that measured added sugar intake showed a statistically significant decrease in added sugar intake or availability; and several interventions showed an improvement in meal (2/4 interventions, 50%) and snack (3/6 interventions, 50%) quality. As this review looked at interventions focused on infants and children aged 0-5, objectives related to improving food resource management were not relevant.

The review found that interventions that focused exclusively on PA successfully increased PA a little more than half the time and improved BMI about one-third of the time. Findings suggest that to increase PA, interventions should include parent engagement as well as improvements in both the quality and quantity of PA offered.

Interventions that focused exclusively on nutrition usually (76% of studies) improved dietary intake, but not weight outcomes (20% of studies). Findings suggest that to improve dietary intake, interventions should include both nutrition education and changes to the foods and beverages offered as well as parent engagement and staff training. Compared to nutrition-only and PA-only interventions, interventions that addressed both nutrition and PA more consistently impacted weight-related outcomes.

Among the studies reviewed, interventions implemented in low-income communities and/or communities of color, which were well represented in the interventions reviewed, were less consistently effective at improving outcomes of interest, particularly nutrition, than those implemented in higher income, predominately white communities.

Conclusions and Recommendations Studies reviewed indicate that to improve body weight, early childhood interventions should be specifically designed to address body weight, include both PA and nutrition components, and have the characteristics described in the box below.

# To improve weight status, interventions should:

- address both nutrition and physical activity (PA);
- increase both time and quality of PA offered;
- make improvements to the food and beverages offered;
- offer PA plus some combination of PA education, PA environment changes and/or nutrition education;
- include comprehensive parent engagement;
- last at least 6 months (longer tends to be better) and;
- include written wellness policies to support the nutrition and PA changes.

# **Table of Contents**

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ii
Introduction	1
Methods	1
I. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	2
II. Evidence Search	3
III. Evidence Synthesis and Analysis	3
Results	4
IV. Descriptive Results	4
V. Analytic Results	7
i. Component Combination Analyses	7
ii. Additional Analyses	20
Conclusions and Recommendations	23
References	26
Appendices	34

# Introduction

ith one in four US children ages two-five years overweight or obese, the need for effective obesity prevention interventions targeting this age group is dire<sup>1</sup>. Early care and education (ECE) sites (e.g., child care centers, Head Start, preschools, and family child care homes) provide an opportune setting for intervention: an estimated 75% of US children under age six attend an ECE program<sup>2</sup>. Therefore, interventions in the ECE setting reach a large proportion of young children (and their parents) for a significant portion of time during their early years when lifelong habits are formed.

In 2016, the USDA strengthened regulations governing foods and beverages offered to children attending programs that participate in the Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP), and states across the nation have implemented policies on nutrition, physical activity and screen time<sup>1</sup>. In 2012, legislation regarding the allowable beverages at licensed childcare sites was implemented in California. This legislation required that sites provide all day access to safe drinking water (including at all meal, snack and play times); limit one-hundred percent juice consumption to one serving per day; restrict milk offerings to fat-free or one-percent unsweetened dairy; and prohibit all beverages with added sweeteners, natural or artificial, except infant formulas or complete balanced nutritional products designed for children<sup>3</sup>.

Research has informed and motivated many of the positive changes underway and continues to guide further intervention in the ECE setting. Many types of intervention strategies have been evaluated empirically and the ever-expanding literature offers increasingly greater insight into promising interventions for preventing childhood obesity.

With the intent of informing evidence-based practices for implementation through the California SNAP-Ed program, we conducted a review of the peer-reviewed, published literature on ECE-based interventions for nutrition and physical activity promotion and obesity prevention. This report presents the findings, which will be combined with those from future reviews to inform comprehensive SNAP-Ed work across multiple settings. It first outlines the methods used to conduct the review, then presents descriptive and analytic findings, and concludes with a discussion and recommendations for California SNAP-Ed.

# **Methods**

The literature review involved the following steps, which are described in detail in this section:

- 1. Developed inclusion and exclusion criteria (I)
- 2. Developed key word search strategies and searched for literature (II & Appendix 2)
- 3. Screened references for inclusion and exclusion (III)
- 4. Abstracted key pieces of information from the included studies (Appendix 1)
- 5. Organized, analyzed and summarized the evidence (IV & V)

# I. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

nclusion and exclusion criteria guided development of search strategies and selection of relevant references for inclusion in the review. All retrieved references were screened for relevance by applying the following criteria.

#### Setting:

- Interventions conducted at a center- or home-based ECE site were eligible for inclusion.
   Interventions that included elementary school children were ineligible.
- Interventions must have been conducted in upper-middle- or high-income countries; categories defined by the World Bank based on Gross National Income per capita in US dollars<sup>4</sup>. Studies conducted in developing countries were excluded due to their questionable generalizability to US populations.
- Multi-setting interventions in which ECE sites were not a primary setting of implementation were excluded from this review.

# • Study Design:

Studies included in this review must have had a control group and measures of the outcome(s) of interest taken before and after an intervention occurred. They could be experiments or natural experiments, defined as follows:

- Randomized Controlled Trial (RCT): includes an exposure randomly assigned by the investigator, measurement of outcome(s) before and after the intervention occurred, and a control group not exposed to the intervention under investigation.
- Quasi-Experimental Study: includes an exposure not randomly assigned by the investigator, measurement of outcome(s) before and after the intervention occurred, and a control group not exposed to the intervention under investigation.
- Cross-over Trial: includes an exposure assigned by the investigator to the same individuals at different points in time, measurement of outcome(s) before and after the intervention occurred, and a control group not exposed to the intervention under investigation.
- Natural Experiments: includes an intervention that occurred outside of the
  investigator's control (the exposure was not assigned by the investigator), measurement
  of outcome(s) before and after the intervention occurred, and a control group not
  exposed to the intervention under investigation.

#### • Intervention:

- Studies must have involved a change in a nutrition- or physical activity-related exposure or another exposure with a potential impact on children's weight status.
- Interventions were not excluded based on expectations regarding feasibility of implementation through SNAP-Ed.

#### Outcome Measures:

Studies must have measured and reported at least one of the following outcome variables both before and after the intervention occurred:

- o **Nutrition:** change in food and beverages offered, served or consumed.
- o **Physical Activity:** change in time spent engaged in PA or change in intensity of PA.
- Weight Status: change in body weight, BMI, skinfold, percent body fat, waist circumference, or other measures of body composition.

## Population:

o Children ages two-five years attending ECE programs.

# II. Evidence Search

uided by the inclusion and exclusion criteria, we created Boolean operator search strategies to run in PubMed (Appendix 2). To maximize efficiency without sacrificing comprehensiveness, we searched for and identified relevant review papers published since January 1, 2005 (date of search: March 4, 2016) and extracted all relevant primary studies from them. We then searched for review papers and primary studies published since January 1, 2005 (date of search: October 26, 2016) to obtain the most recent publications. The PubMed searches yielded a total of 3,609 references, which we screened for relevance by their title, abstract and/or full paper.

Key word searches (Appendix 2) were also conducted in other relevant literature databases, including Health Systems Evidence; USDA's Nutrition Evidence Library; Robert Wood Johnson Foundation's *What Works for Health*; Transtria; Academy of Nutrition and Dietetics' Evidence Analysis Library; and Center for Training and Research Translation for any relevant studies not indexed in PubMed.

# III. Evidence Synthesis and Analysis

o organize and interpret the literature, we identified nine common components that were included in the interventions (Appendix 4.) Then, we categorized interventions that had similar components into nine different groups (Table 4.)

We evaluated intervention effectiveness according to impact on outcomes aligned with the California SNAP-Ed statewide objectives (Appendix 3,) which include the following:

- **Nutrition:** change in consumption or offering of fruits and vegetables, healthy meals and snacks, foods and beverages characterized by added sugar and/or calories.
- **Physical Activity:** change in total physical activity, vigorous physical activity, moderate-vigorous physical activity, moderate physical activity, and light physical activity.
- Weight Status: change in BMI, BMI z-score, skinfold thickness, percent body fat, waist circumference, and/or prevalence of overweight and obesity.

All analyses presented in this report are limited to California SNAP-Ed statewide objective-aligned (SO) outcomes. Interventions were defined as "effective" or "null" as follows (Appendix 5):

- Effective interventions demonstrated statistical significance for ≥1 SO-related outcome, and had no negative or undesirable outcomes.
- Ineffective or Null interventions did not demonstrate statistical significance for ≥1 SO-related outcome. Any studies which had combinations of null or any negative results were also included in this category.

The following summary terms are used to indicate the quantity of evidence available for any given analysis:

Ample: ≥20 interventions
 Sufficient: 10-19 interventions
 Limited: 6-9 interventions
 Insufficient: <6 interventions</li>

# **Results**

# IV. Descriptive Results

ixty-five primary studies describing 70 interventions met the criteria for inclusion in this review (Appendix 1). Publication dates ranged between 1998 and 2016 though most (n=54; 77%) were published after 2010. Sixty-eight interventions were tested via experiments, including 53 RCTs, five cross-over trials, and ten quasi-experiments, and two interventions were tested via natural experiments.

Forty-two interventions were tested in the United States (U.S.); six in Belgium; five in Australia; four in Germany; two each in Thailand, China, and Switzerland; one each in Scotland, Israel, Canada, Chile, Spain, England, and Turkey; and one study did not report a location. All interventions were implemented in ECE centers, including preschools, nursery schools, Head Start centers, and day care centers. None were implemented in home-based childcare sites. Most of the interventions (>90%) were tested among samples that included low-income children and/or ethnic/racial minorities.

The interventions generally involved ECE site-based changes regarding nutrition and/or physical activity. Two studies were of state-level policies; one that regulated nutrition standards<sup>20</sup> and the other PA standards<sup>21</sup>. We grouped activities included in the interventions into nine categories (see Appendix 4 for definitions.)

- 1. Nutrition education for children (Nut. Ed.)
- 2. Foods and/or beverages served during meals (*Meal FB*)
- 3. Foods and/or beverages served outside of meals (FB Outside Meals)
- 4. Physical activity offered to children (*PA Offered*)
- 5. Changes made to the physical activity environment (PA Environment)
- 6. Physical activity education for children (*PA Education*)
- 7. Screen time regulations (Screen time)
- 8. Parent engagement

## 9. Wellness-related policy (*Policy*)

Note: "FB" without a qualifier refers to all foods and beverages (including meals and outside meals).

Then, we categorized interventions that had similar combinations of activities into 9 different groups:

- PA Offered Only
- PA Offered + PA Education and/or PA Environment (PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env.)
- PA Env. Only
- Nutrition Education Only (Nut. Ed. Only)
- Nutrition Education + Food and Beverage (FB) Changes (Nut. Ed. + FB)
- FB Only
- Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.
- Nut. Ed. + PA Ed. + PA Offered
- FB + PA offered +/- PA Ed./Env.+/-Nut. Ed.

Screen time regulations, parent engagement and wellness-related policies were not offered as solo interventions but were rather one component, but not a distinguishing component, of some of the interventions in the groups described above. Parent engagement was also analyzed separately because it was a common component of the various combinations above.

Of the 70 interventions included in this review, 45 had at least one nutrition component, 52 had at least one physical activity component, and 24 had at least one nutrition component and at least one PA component. The most frequently included intervention components were *Nut. Ed., PA Offered, PA Ed.* and *Parent Engagement* (Table 1). The most commonly paired nutrition and PA components were *PA Offered + PA Ed.; Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.*, and *Nut. Ed. + PA Offered* (Table 2). On average, interventions had 3.5 components, and the number of components per intervention ranged from one to nine.

Table 1. Number of interventions that included each component

Component	Nut. Ed.	Meal FB	FB Outside Meals	PA Offered	PA Environ.	PA Ed.	Screen Time	Parent Engagement	Policy
Frequency	35	15	11	36	16	27	9	39	12

Table 2. Number of interventions that included each pairwise combination of components

	Nut. Ed.	Meal FB	FB Outside Meals	PA Offered	PA Environ.	PA Ed.	Screen Time	Parent Engagement	Policy
Nut. Ed.	35	9	11	16	5	18	8	30	6
Meal FB	9	15	10	7	3	8	2	11	5
FB Outside Meals	11	10	11	6	2	7	2	12	6
PA Offered	17	7	6	6	11	24	8	19	3
PA Env.	5	3	2	11	16	8	1	9	2
PA Ed.	16	8	7	24	8	27	6	20	4
Screen Time	8	2	2	8	1	6	9	7	2
Parent Engagement	32	11	12	19	9	20	7	39	10
Policy	6	5	6	3	2	4	2	10	12

All 70 intervention evaluations measured at least one outcome aligned with a CA SNAP-Ed objective; 26 interventions measured at least one outcome aligned with a nutrition state objective, 41 measured at least one outcome aligned with a PA state objective, and 36 measured at least one weight status outcome. The magnitude of effects demonstrated for weight status outcomes are described in Appendix 6. Some outcomes were measured more frequently than others, with the most common being fruits and vegetables (FVs) offered, served or consumed, Moderate to Vigorous Physical Activity (MVPA), Total PA, and BMI (Table 3).

Table 3. Number of interventions that measured each outcome

Outcome <sup>i</sup>	# Interventions that Measured		
Any Nutrition	26		
Fruits and Vegetables (FV)	20		
Added Sugar	9		
Meal Quality	4		
Snack Quality	6		
Energy Intake	7		
Any PA	41		
Light PA	13		
Moderate PA	9		
Vigorous PA	16		
Moderate-to- Vigorous PA	25		
Total PA	27		
Any Weight Status <sup>ii</sup>	36		
ВМІ	27		
BMI z-score	17		
Skinfold Thickness	10		
Percent Body Fat	7		
Waist Circumference	4		
Percent Overweight	2		

Nutrition outcomes refer to foods and beverages offered, served or consumed.

# V. Analytic Results

# i. Component Combination Analyses

his section presents the results of analyses conducted to understand if combining different components increased the intervention effectiveness. We synthesized the existing evidence in four broad intervention categories: 1) just PA components, 2) just Nutrition components, 3) PA + Nutrition components. Two interventions incorporated only staff training; these were put into a fourth category: 4) just Staff Training components. (See: Table 4)

iiMagnitudes of effects are described in Appendix 6

# A. PA Only interventions

PHYSICAL ACTIVITY INTERVENTIONS IN ECE ARE EFFECTIVE AT INCREASING PA LEVEL A LITTLE MORE THAN HALF THE TIME, AND EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING BMI ABOUT ONE-THIRD OF THE TIME.

MULTI-COMPONENT PA INTERVENTIONS TEND TO BE MORE CONSISTENTLY EFFECTIVE AT INCREASING PA THAN THOSE USING A SINGLE APPROACH.

wenty-five *PA Only* interventions<sup>8-11, 13-16, 21, 22, 26, 30, 31, 34, 36, 37, 48-50, 54, 59, 60, 64, 66, 70</sup> included changes in the quantity or quality of PA opportunities provided to children during the ECE day, changes in the PA environment, and/or activity-based curriculum to emphasize the importance of PA. Approximately half of the studies found a positive impact in at least one outcome of interest: 23 studies measured PA outcomes<sup>8-11, 13-16, 21, 22, 26, 30, 31, 34, 36, 37, 48, 49, 59, 60, 64, 66, 70</sup> and 13 of them were effective at increasing PA <sup>10, 13-16, 22, 30, 31, 34, 48, 49, 60, 66, 70</sup>. Nine studies of these interventions evaluated BMI outcomes <sup>13, 16, 22, 30, 31, 48, 50, 54, 64, 66</sup> and three found a positive effect<sup>13, 16, 54</sup>.

Several *PA Only* interventions changed the quality of activities but did not increase the allocated time for the activities <sup>9-11, 22, 30, 31, 36, 37, 48, 50, 59, 66</sup>. For example, some of them changed free outdoor playtime to more structured activities, or promoted locomotor and manipulative skills, such as running, jumping, climbing, kicking, throwing and catching, and dancing, among others <sup>22, 30, 31, 36, 37, 48, 50, 54, 59, 60, 66</sup>.

The duration of the interventions varied from a minimum of four weeks<sup>26</sup> to 24 months<sup>64</sup> with an average of seven months. Four interventions included parents, mainly by providing educational flyers<sup>30, 31, 34, 64, 66</sup>; two of them provided more active parent engagement by including a variety of activities such as interactive education seminars and workshops on PA and nutrition, family events, engagement in project management committees, and at-home activities<sup>30, 31, 66</sup>.

In most studies, the control group received the standard PA curriculum or program, which varied across studies, but generally consisted in approximately 30 minutes per day of free outdoor playtime or structured activities. It is therefore likely that children were physically active to some degree before the implementation of the intervention.

- A bit more than half of the studies (13/23) found that PA Only interventions were effective at increasing PA.
- One third of the studies (3/9) found that PA Only interventions were effective at improving BMI.
- Generally, effective PA Only interventions were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months) in comparison to ineffective interventions.
- Around two-thirds of *PA Only* interventions (9/12 interventions that reported SES or race/ethnicity) were implemented among low-income populations and/or communities of color. The results of interventions in these communities did not differ from those implemented among other populations.
- **PA Only** interventions that included active parent engagement strategies were consistently effective (2/2 interventions) at improving physical activity outcomes.

- Multi-component **PA Only** interventions were more consistently effective (9/13 interventions) at increasing PA than those using a single approach (4/12 interventions).
- Interventions that increased the quality and quantity of PA opportunities were more consistently effective (6/8 interventions) at improving PA outcomes than those that increased just the time (1/3 interventions) or just the quality of PA (2/4 interventions).

## (1) PA Offered Only

INCREASING BOTH TIME AND QUALITY OF PA OFFERED MIGHT BE MORE EFFECTIVE THAN JUST CHANGING ONE COMPONENT.

ine *PA Offered Only* interventions<sup>8, 10, 11, 21, 22, 49, 54, 59, 66</sup> only included changes in the quantity and/or quality of PA opportunities provided to children during the ECE day, including additional recess time, structured indoor or outdoor activities, games and dancing. Eight studies measured PA outcomes<sup>8, 10, 11, 21, 22, 49, 54, 59, 66</sup> and four of them<sup>10, 22, 49, 66</sup> found positive effects. Three studies analyzed the intervention effect on BMI<sup>22, 54, 66</sup> and one found positive results, but just among girls<sup>54</sup>.

Four *PA Offered Only* interventions changed the quality of PA opportunities to more structured activities without increasing the allocated time for PA <sup>10, 11, 22, 59</sup>. Two of these four interventions were effective at improving PA outcomes <sup>10, 22</sup>.

Three interventions increased only PA quantity by providing 60 minutes of extra recess<sup>8</sup>; enacting a state-level policy requiring 60 minutes of light, moderate and vigorous PA per day<sup>21</sup>; and/or adding a morning walk and afternoon aerobic dance<sup>54</sup>. Two<sup>8, 21</sup> of these three interventions measured PA outcomes; of these two; neither was effective at improving PA outcomes.

Two studies increased both PA quantity and quality and were consistently effective (2/2 interventions) at increasing PA<sup>49, 66</sup>. The majority of *PA Offered Only* interventions included 30-60 minutes of daily PA.

The average **duration** of the studies was eight months. Only one intervention included parents and it was effective at improving PA outcomes, but not BMI (66). Five studies<sup>8, 11, 21, 49, 59</sup> were of interventions implemented among low-income communities and/or communities of color and only one found a positive effect<sup>49</sup> on PA outcomes.

- One half of the PA Offered Only interventions (4/8 interventions) were effective at increasing PA.
- One third of **PA Offered Only** interventions (1/3 interventions) were effective at improving weight outcomes.
- Increasing both quantity and quality of PA offered may be more effective (2/2 interventions) than changing quantity only (0/2 interventions) or quality only (2/4 interventions) at improving PA outcomes.

- Generally, **PA Offered Only** interventions that were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months) were more frequently effective (3/5 interventions) at improving PA outcomes than those implemented over a shorter period of time (1/3 interventions).
- **PA Offered Only** studies implemented among low-income communities and/or communities of color were not consistently effective, only 1 of 5 interventions improved PA outcomes. However, only 7 of the 9 studies provided information about race/ethnicity or income. The one study implemented among middle- to higher-income white children had a positive outcome.

# (2) PA Offered + PA Ed or Environment

IMPROVING AND/OR INCREASING PA OFFERED COUPLED WITH PA EDUCATION OR PA ENVIRONMENT CHANGES MAY HAVE AN ADDITIVE OR SYNERGISTIC POSITIVE EFFECT ON PA.

hirteen interventions made changes in *PA Offered* and a combination of *PA Ed. and/or PA Env.* changes <sup>9, 13-16, 30, 31, 34, 36, 37, 48, 50, 60, 64, 70</sup>. These *PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env.* interventions included providing structured PA instead of free outdoor playtime or offering activities and games to increase PA time. Some studies integrated PA education into the curriculum or changed the physical environment by enhancing the fixed and portable play structures to engage children in PA.

Fourteen studies of *PA Offered* + *PA Ed. and/or PA Env.* interventions evaluated PA outcomes <sup>9, 13-16, 30, 31, 34, 36, 37, 48, 60, 64, 70</sup> and nine found statistically significant increases <sup>13-16, 30, 31, 34, 48, 60, 70</sup>. Seven *PA Offered* + *PA Ed. and/or PA Env.* studies measured BMI<sup>13, 16, 30, 31, 48, 50, 64</sup> and two found a positive effect <sup>13, 16</sup>. Two interventions involved parents by providing flyers and newsletters <sup>34, 64</sup> (passive engagement), and one <sup>30, 31</sup> included a participatory parent-focused approach (active engagement). Five studies <sup>9, 13, 14, 16, 34</sup> looked at *PA Offered* + *PA Ed. and/or PA Env.* implemented among low-income communities and/or communities of color and four <sup>13, 14, 16, 34</sup> found at least one positive effect. The interventions had an average duration of seven months.

In most studies, the control group received the standard PA curriculum (depending on the study: 30 minutes of unstructured play; structured PA time without receiving PA education; one hour of gym class without receiving parent engagement or environment changes, etc.)

- PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env. interventions were more consistently effective at improving PA outcomes (9/12 interventions) than PA Offered Only interventions (4/8 interventions), but were equally effective at improving BMI (2/6 PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env. interventions; 1/3 PA Offered Only interventions).
- PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env. interventions were more consistently effective at improving
  PA outcomes (9/12 interventions) than any other combination of PA components: PA Offered
  Only (4/8 interventions) and PA Env. Only (0/3 interventions).
- Generally, PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env. interventions that were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months) were less frequently effective at improving PA outcomes, but more frequently effective at improving BMI than those implemented over a shorter period of time.

 PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env. interventions implemented among low-income communities and/or communities of color were more consistently effective at improving PA (4/5 interventions) and BMI outcomes (2/2 interventions) compared to those implemented among higher income white children.

# (3) PA Environment Only

PROVIDING PLAYGROUND EQUIPMENT OR MARKINGS ALONE MAY NOT BE AN EFFECTIVE WAY OF INCREASING PA.

hree *PA Env. Only* interventions<sup>26</sup> involved providing playground equipment and/or playground markings and none of them proved effective. All three interventions were implemented in Flanders and had a duration of less than six months. The evidence suggests that providing playground equipment or markings alone might not be an effective way of increasing PA.

# B. Nutrition Only interventions

NUTRITION ONLY INTERVENTIONS ARE EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING DIETARY INTAKE BUT MAY BE LESS EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING WEIGHT OUTCOMES.

wenty-one studies evaluated the impact of interventions including nutrition components only <sup>17, 18, 20, 29, 32, 43, 45-47, 52, 51, 61-63, 65, 68, 69, 71-74</sup>. *Nutrition Only* strategies included 1) *Nut. Ed.*, 2) *Nut. Ed + FB*, and 3) *FB Only*.

Fourteen of the 21 studies <sup>18, 32, 43, 45-47, 52, 61-63, 65, 68, 69, 71, 72, 74</sup> found a positive impact in at least one outcome of interest (dietary intake or weight). Fifteen studies measured dietary outcomes <sup>18, 20, 32, 43, 45-47, 52, 51, 65, 68, 69, 71, 72, 74</sup> and 13 studies showed improved dietary intake <sup>18, 32, 43, 45-47, 52, 65, 68, 69, 71, 72, 74</sup>. One limitation was the lack of consistency in how dietary outcomes were measured across studies. Three <sup>61-63</sup> of the seven studies that measured weight outcomes <sup>17, 29, 32, 61-63, 73</sup> found a positive effect, although these three studies were of one intervention. Furthermore, significant positive effects were only seen for the 3-year follow-up subscapular skinfold z-score but not for BMI, waist circumference, or subscapular skinfold z-scores taken at 2-year and 1-year follow-up.

The duration of *Nutrition Only* interventions ranged from five weeks<sup>68</sup> to three school years<sup>61-63</sup>, with an average of seven months. Eight interventions provided active parent engagement strategies such as nutrition education sessions with take-home materials and activities for parents to do with children, recipes, meetings, and focus groups<sup>18, 32, 46, 51, 71-74</sup>. Eight interventions were implemented in low-income communities or in ECE sites with a high proportion of children of color<sup>18, 20, 32, 45, 51, 72, 73, 74</sup>.

- Most of the studies (13/15) found that *Nutrition Only* interventions were effective at improving at least one aspect of dietary intake.
- Less than half (3/7) of the studies found that **Nutrition Only** interventions were effective at improving at least one weight-related outcome.
- Interventions with active parent engagement strategies were consistently effective (6/7 interventions) at improving dietary intake.

- Interventions that were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months) were nearly as
  consistently effective (5/7 interventions) at improving dietary outcomes as those implemented
  over a shorter period of time (8/10 interventions).
- The only **Nutrition Only** intervention that measured BMI had a duration of ≥6 months and was not associated with any significant positive effect.
- Interventions among low-income children and/or children of color were slightly less effective at improving dietary outcomes (4/6 interventions) compared to those implemented among higher income and/or white children (6/7 interventions).

## (4) Nutrition Education Only

NUTRITION EDUCATION ONLY INTERVENTIONS ARE CONSISTENTLY EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING DIETARY INTAKE AMONG MIDDLE TO HIGH INCOME CHILDREN IN THE SHORT TERM BUT HAVE NOT PROVEN EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING WEIGHT OUTCOMES. IMPACT ON LOW INCOME CHILDREN AND/OR CHILDREN OF COLOR HAS NOT BEEN ADEQUATELY STUDIED.

ine interventions (examined in 11 studies) focused on nutrition education only <sup>17, 29, 43, 46, 61-63, 65, 68, 68, 69, 74</sup>. *Nut. Ed. Only* interventions generally entailed teachers or trained professionals delivering an activity-based curriculum to children in designated, regularly occurring time sessions (i.e., lessons). Teachers or other trained professionals covered topics such as food groups, the human body and digestion, nutrients, and the importance of healthy eating and active living. Six <sup>43, 46, 65, 68, 69, 74</sup> of 11 *Nut. Ed. Only* studies measured nutrition outcomes and all six found a combination of positive and null outcomes. However, nutrition outcomes were measured differently across studies. The remaining five *Nut. Ed. Only* studies (of 11 total), representing three interventions, only measured weight outcomes <sup>17, 62, 63</sup>. Of those five, three studies <sup>61, 62, 63</sup>, all of the same intervention, found positive weight outcomes.

*Nut. Ed. Only* interventions had an average duration of five months. Two interventions had active parent engagement<sup>46,74</sup>.

Four out of 6 *Nut. Ed. Only* interventions that reported participants' income level were implemented in middle- to high-income communities<sup>43, 65, 68, 69</sup>. Only one of the nine interventions that provided *Nut. Ed. Only* was implemented in a low-income community that also had diverse racial composition<sup>74</sup>. This intervention also included active parent engagement consisting of six modules of 30-60 minute weekly lessons with take-home materials and activities for parents to do with children. Parents reported a significant increase in vegetables consumed at home and in use of low-fat milk at home. No change was reported in fruit consumption or number of days that the child requested a fruit or vegetable as a snack.

- **Nut. Ed. Only** interventions are consistently effective at improving dietary outcomes in middle-to high-income children (6/6 interventions) and weight outcomes (1/1 intervention).
- Only one *Nut. Ed. Only* study reported including low-income participants. The intervention was
  effective at improving some dietary outcomes (described above), but the study did not measure
  weight-related outcomes.

 Most Nut. Ed. Only interventions that measured dietary outcomes had a duration of less than six months; only 1 had a duration of ≥6 months. All interventions were effective at improving some dietary outcomes regardless of intervention length.

# (5) Nutrition Education + FB Changes

COMBINING FB CHANGES WITH NUTRITION EDUCATION IS EFFECTIVE A LITTLE MORE THAN HALF THE TIME AMONG LOW- INCOME, ETHNICALLY/RACIALLY DIVERSE CHILDREN BUT HAS NOT PROVEN EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING WEIGHT OUTCOMES.

even interventions<sup>18, 20, 32, 51, 71-73</sup> focused mainly on food and beverage modification to improve meal healthfulness. These interventions also encouraged nutrition in the school curriculum through classes and activities such as games, crafts, tales, songs, working in the garden, and taste tests, among others. Nutrition classes covered topics such as food types, food preparation, eating cultures, food variety and healthy behaviors. Four interventions included wellness-related policies governing foods and beverages provided by the ECE sites<sup>18, 20, 51, 71</sup>.

Four<sup>18, 32, 71, 72</sup> of the six studies<sup>18, 20, 32, 51, 71, 72</sup> that measured nutrition outcomes of *Nut. Ed.+ FB* interventions found a positive effect for at least one outcome. Two interventions that measured BMI found a null effect<sup>32, 73</sup>. Two out of the four interventions mentioned above that included wellness-related policies were effective: one in modifying policies and practices and providing healthier food and beverage offerings (foods consistent with Dietary Guidelines for Americans; water and plain milk)<sup>18</sup>; and the second in increasing fresh fruit consumption<sup>71</sup>.

The majority of *Nut. Ed.+ FB* (4/7 interventions) interventions were implemented in low-income communities <sup>18, 51, 72, 73</sup>. Included studies were heterogeneous in the intervention components and outcomes measured. The majority of *Nut. Ed. + FB* interventions (4/7) were effective for at least one outcome <sup>18, 32, 71, 72</sup>, particularly in increasing fruit consumption <sup>18, 32, 71</sup>. However, these studies <sup>18, 32, 71, 72</sup> on *Nut. Ed.+ FB* interventions all found a combination of positive and null dietary outcomes. Only one study found positive results in eight out of nine diet measurements including fruit and vegetable consumption <sup>18</sup>. The intervention studied had a strong focus on training the staff that helped to implement a FB policy to provide only non-sweetened drinks and foods. Compared with *Nut. Ed.* interventions, *Nut. Ed. + FB* interventions had a longer duration- all lasted six months or more, with an average of one year.

- Two-thirds of the studies (4/6), most of which include low-income participants, found that *Nut. Ed.* + *FB* interventions were effective at improving at least one dietary outcome.
- Neither of 2 studies found that *Nut. Ed. + FB* was effective at improving BMI.
- Interventions with active parent engagement were consistently effective (2/2 interventions) at improving dietary outcomes.
- Interventions that had a strong staff training component were more frequently effective at improving dietary outcomes (3/4 interventions) than those that did not have a strong staff training component (1/2 interventions).

• Effective interventions with nutrition-related policies offered support to implement the policy, monitored the adoption of the policy components and provided performance feedback to the ECE sites.

# (6) FB Only (meal and/or non-meal FB)

A LIMITED NUMBER OF STUDIES INDICATE THAT MAKING SMALL CHANGES IN FEEDING PRACTICES OR PORTION SIZE WAS EFFECTIVE A LITTLE MORE THAN HALF THE TIME. MORE STUDIES ARE NEEDED THAT EVALUATE MORE SUBSTANTIVE CHANGES IN FEEDING PRACTICES AND FOODS AND BEVERAGES OFFERED.

portioned lunch service style, timing of meal components)<sup>45, 47</sup> or changes in portion size<sup>47, 52</sup>. Three out of five interventions in this category found a positive effect on at least one nutrition outcome<sup>45, 47, 52</sup>. The duration of *FB Only* interventions ranged from two weeks to six weeks. None of the *FB Only* interventions included parents. Two interventions<sup>45</sup> were implemented in a predominantly African American community and only one was effective for increasing fruit intake. This intervention provided fruits and vegetables before serving other items via family style during lunch.

# C. Nutrition + PA interventions

ECE INTERVENTIONS ARE MOST CONSISTENTLY EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING BMI WHEN THEY INCLUDE BOTH PA AND NUTRITION.

ECE INTERVENTIONS THAT INCLUDE NUTRITION AND PA COMPONENTS TEND TO BE LESS EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING DIETARY INTAKE THAN THOSE THAT FOCUS ONLY ON NUTRITION, AND LESS EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING PA OUTCOMES THAN THOSE THAT FOCUS ONLY ON PA.

wenty-six studies 5-7, 12, 19, 23-25, 27, 28, 33, 35, 38-41, 53, 55-58, 67, 75-78 evaluated the effect of 22 interventions that provided a combination of *Nutrition + PA* interventions. Nutrition-focused intervention components included nutrition education and food and beverage changes. Intervention components to improve PA included increasing time allocated to PA, providing structured physical activity lessons, integrating the importance of PA into the curriculum (*PA Ed.*) and changing the PA environment (*PA Env.*). Over two-thirds (19/26) of these studies reported at least one positive weight, dietary, and/or PA outcome of interest 5-7, 12, 23-25, 27, 33, 35, 38, 40, 55-57, 67, 76-78. Of the 19 that measured a weight outcome, 10 (53%) were effective, suggesting that these types of interventions are more consistently effective at improving BMI than providing PA or nutrition alone.

The duration of these types of interventions varied from a minimum of six weeks<sup>76</sup> to two years<sup>33</sup> with an average of 11 months. Most of the interventions had some kind of parental involvement<sup>5-7, 12, 19, 23-25, 27, 28, 33, 38-41, 53, 55-58, 67, 75-78</sup>, and many interventions provided active parent engagement strategies such as interactive education seminars and workshops on PA and nutrition, family events, engagement in project management committees, cooking classes and at-home activities<sup>5-7, 12, 24, 25, 27, 28, 33, 41, 53, 55-58, 67, 75, 77, 78</sup>

With regard to PA, five of the interventions increased only the allocated time assigned to PA<sup>38, 39, 40, 41, 78</sup>, two interventions increased only quality<sup>33, 75</sup>, and seven increased both quantity and quality of PA<sup>19, 24, 25, 27, 28, 35, 53,77</sup>. In terms of nutrition, the majority of the interventions (19/22) provided nutrition education<sup>5-</sup>

<sup>7, 12, 19, 23-25, 27, 28, 35, 38-41, 53, 55-57, 67, 75-77</sup>. Nine interventions <sup>5-7, 12, 27, 28, 33, 53, 55-58, 78</sup> provided improvement to FB offered. The control group in most of these interventions received the usual nutrition and PA supports and activities.

## **Findings**

- Compared with interventions that focus only on nutrition, *Nutrition + PA* interventions were less consistently effective (5/10 interventions) at improving dietary intake.
- Compared with interventions that focus only on nutrition or only PA, Nutrition + PA
  interventions were more frequently effective (10/17 interventions) at improving BMI.
- **Nutrition + PA** interventions with active parent engagement strategies were not more frequently effective (9/14 interventions) at improving any outcome compared to those that provided passive parent engagement (4/5 interventions) or no parent engagement at all (2/2 interventions).
- Interventions that increased both quantity and quality of PA offered were more frequently effective at improving PA outcomes (4/5 interventions), compared to interventions that increased only quantity of PA (1/4 interventions) or just the quality of PA offered (0/2 interventions.
- Generally, Nutrition + PA interventions that were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months) were more frequently effective at improving BMI (6/10 interventions) than those implemented over a shorter period of time (4/9 interventions).
- Fourteen Nutrition + PA interventions were implemented among low-income populations and/or ethnic/racial minorities. Interventions implemented in these communities were equally effective at improving PA outcomes (4/12 interventions), but less consistently effective at improving nutrition (3/8 interventions) and BMI outcomes (6/13 interventions) compared to those implemented among higher income white children.

#### (7) Nutrition Education + PA Education

Interventions that combine Nutrition and PA education appear promising with regard to weight outcomes and nutrition outcomes, but too few studies have been conducted to arrive at a definitive conclusion, especially for low-income children.

hree studies of three interventions investigated the impacts of integrating nutrition education and physical activity education into the curriculum via interactive lessons, games and/or books to teach children about healthful eating and PA<sup>23, 67, 76</sup>. All three studies reported a positive effect on at least one outcome of interest. One study measured PA and found a significant positive impact<sup>23</sup>. Two studies that measured a weight status outcome found a combination of positive <sup>67</sup> and null<sup>23</sup> results. Positive results included decreases in skinfold thickness, % body fat, fat mass index and fat-free mass index, both among obese and normal weight children<sup>67</sup>.

The average duration of the interventions was 6.5 months with a minimum of six weeks<sup>76</sup> and a maximum of 12 months<sup>67</sup>. One intervention included active parent engagement that included

workshops for parents on nutrition and physical activity<sup>67</sup>. This intervention was also conducted among low-income children and was effective<sup>67</sup>.

Overall, there are too few studies in this category to analyze what, if any, element increased the effectiveness of nutrition and PA education.

# (8) Nutrition Education + PA Education + PA Offered

ALTHOUGH NUT. ED. + PA ED. + PA OFFERED STRATEGIES WAS THE MOST COMMON COMBINATION OFFERED, THE INTERVENTIONS WERE LESS EFFECTIVE FOR WEIGHT AND NUTRITION OUTCOMES AND MORE EFFECTIVE FOR PA OUTCOMES THAN OTHER COMBINATIONS.

en interventions integrated nutrition education and PA education into the curriculum and changed the quantity or quality of PA opportunities provided to children during the ECE day<sup>19, 24, 25, 35, 38, 39, 40, 41, 75, 77</sup>. Nutrition education and PA education generally entailed teachers or trained professionals delivering activity-based curriculum that addressed the importance of healthy eating and PA through games and interactive activities. Four interventions modified the quality by providing structured PA<sup>19, 41, 77</sup>, and six increased both the time and the quality of PA offered<sup>24, 25, 35, 38, 39, 40, 75</sup>

Five of ten interventions were effective<sup>24, 25, 35, 40, 77</sup> at improving PA outcomes and four were effective at improving BMI<sup>24, 25, 35, 38, 77</sup>. Of the five studies that measured nutrition outcomes<sup>24, 25, 40, 41, 77</sup> and only two interventions had a significant impact<sup>24, 25, 77</sup>.

The average duration of these types of interventions was five months, and varied from a minimum of 14 weeks to 11 months. Eight interventions included parents<sup>24, 25, 19, 38, 39, 40, 41, 75, 77</sup>, but only four had active parent engagement strategies including nutrition and PA educational sessions and take-home activities<sup>24, 25, 41, 75, 77</sup>. Of these interventions that included active parent engagement: the same two interventions were found to be effective at improving weight outcomes, dietary outcomes, and PA outcomes <sup>24, 25, 77</sup>. It is important to note that one of these references<sup>77</sup> included two slightly different interventions; the intervention found to be effective on improving these three outcome categories was a combined child care center- family home approach. The child care center-only intervention did not show any statistically significant improvements in BMI z-score, whereas the combined center- family home approach did<sup>77</sup>.

Nine of these ten interventions were implemented in low-income and/or communities of color <sup>19, 24, 25, 38, 39, 40, 41, 75, 77</sup>. All studies on these nine interventions measured weight outcomes, and three interventions were effective <sup>24, 25, 38, 77</sup>. Similarly, all of these studies measured PA outcomes, and four interventions were effective <sup>24, 25, 40, 77</sup>. Several studies measured dietary outcomes <sup>24, 25, 40, 41, 77</sup>, and two interventions were found to be effective <sup>24, 25, 77</sup>.

These findings confirm the findings from other interventions with a combination approach: nutrition education without food and beverage changes is not consistently effective at improving dietary outcomes among low-income populations and/or populations of color; combining nutrition and PA is more effective at improving body weight than either alone; and an exclusive focus on PA is more effective at improving PA than a more comprehensive nutrition and PA approach.

- Compared with nutrition-only interventions, interventions that provided Nut. Ed. + PA Ed. + PA
   Offered were less effective (2/5 interventions) at improving dietary intake, but more effective
   (4/10 interventions) at improving weight outcomes.
- Compared with all other *PA + Nut*. interventions, *Nut*. *Ed*. + *PA Ed*.+ *PA Offered* interventions were similarly effective (2/4 interventions) at improving nutrition outcomes, more effective at improving PA outcomes (5/10 interventions) and less effective (4/10 interventions) at improving weight outcomes.
- Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.+ PA Offered interventions with active parent engagement (compared to no active parent engagement) were more effective at improving dietary outcomes and PA outcomes (2/3 interventions in each case); and a bit more effective at improving weight outcomes (2/4 interventions).
- Since only two of ten Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.+ PA Offered interventions lasted more than six months it
  is not possible to arrive at conclusions regarding intervention duration FB changes + PA offered
  + PA education, PA environment and/or Nut Ed
- Given that 9 of 10 studies were conducted with low-income and/or communities of color, these results are applicable to those populations.

# (9) FB Changes + PA Offered + PA Ed or Environment + Nutrition Education

FB CHANGES + PA OFFERED + PA ED./ENV. AND/OR NUT. ED. INTERVENTIONS ARE MORE CONSISTENTLY EFFECTIVE AT IMPROVING WEIGHT THAN THE MAJORITY OF OTHER INTERVENTION COMBINATIONS.

ine interventions provided changes in food and beverages, offered physical activity and a combination of PA/ Nutrition education and/or PA environment changes 5-7, 12, 27, 28, 33, 53, 55-58, 78. Foods and beverages in these interventions were modified by improving preparation and serving, providing healthier beverages, snacks and meals, and/or increasing water access. Two interventions modified PA quality/environment by providing games-based fine motor skills development, improving the playground environment 5-7, 33 and implementing health-focused PE<sup>33</sup>, and four increased both the time and the quality of PA offered 27, 28, 53, 78. Four interventions included curriculum-based nutrition education with activities such as taste tests, healthy cooking classes or puppet shows 5-7, 28, 53, 55-57.

Six out of nine interventions were effective for at least one outcome of interest 5-7, 12, 27, 33, 55-57, 78. Six 5-7, 55-57 of the nine studies 5, 6, 7, 12, 33, 53, 55, 56, 57 that measured nutrition outcomes for this group of interventions found positive outcomes, although these six studies looked at two interventions only. Only one 27, 58 out of five interventions (7 studies) 5, 6, 7, 12, 27, 33, 58 that measured PA found positive effects. However, five 5-7, 12, 33, 55-57, 78 out of seven interventions (9 of 11 studies) that measured weight outcomes 5-7, 12, 28, 33, 55-58, 78 found a positive effect. In these nine studies of five interventions, all participants were low-income and/or people of color.

The duration of these types of interventions varied from a minimum of six months<sup>58</sup> to two years<sup>33</sup>, with an average of 14 months. All interventions had active parent engagement. Most interventions in this group (seven) had a strong training component for child care providers and other staff<sup>5-7, 12, 28, 53, 55-57, 58, 78</sup>. Researchers maintained regular contact with the staff and provided technical assistance and monitoring to ensure implementation.

Eight interventions<sup>5-7,12, 27, 28, 33, 53, 55-58</sup> were implemented in ECE sites serving predominantly low-income children and/or children of color, and five were effective for any outcome of interest<sup>5-7,12, 27, 33, 55-57</sup>. Of

the eight interventions; 4/6 interventions were effective at improving weight outcomes <sup>5, 6, 7, 12, 33, 55, 56, 57</sup>, 2/5 interventions were effective at improving dietary outcomes <sup>5, 6, 7, 55, 56, 57</sup>, and only 1/5 of interventions was effective at improving PA outcomes <sup>27</sup>.

## Findings:

- These interventions were more frequently effective at improving weight outcomes (5/7 interventions) than the majority of other interventions.
- These interventions were less frequently effective at improving PA outcomes (1/5 interventions) than **PA Only** interventions.
- These interventions were less frequently effective at improving nutrition outcomes (2/5 interventions) than *Nutrition Only* interventions.
- Of interventions that measured weight outcomes, interventions that included wellness-related policies<sup>5-7, 12, 33, 55-58</sup> were slightly more effective (4/5 interventions) at improving weight outcomes than those without any wellness-related policy that measured weight outcomes<sup>28, 78</sup> (1/2 interventions).
- Only one of nine interventions lasted less than six months; it was shown to be effective at improving both outcome categories measured (weight and dietary); PA outcomes were not measured.
- Of the eight interventions in this category that included low-income children and/or children of color: 4/6 interventions were effective at improving weight outcomes, 2/5 interventions were effective at improving dietary outcomes, and only 1/5 of interventions was effective at improving PA outcomes.
- Since all interventions included active parent engagement and most had a strong training component, no conclusions can be drawn about their contribution to the outcomes.

# D. Parent Engagement

INTERVENTIONS WITH ACTIVE PARENT ENGAGEMENT WERE ONLY A BIT MORE FREQUENTLY EFFECTIVE THAN THOSE WITH PASSIVE PARENT ENGAGEMENT.

wenty-five interventions with active parent engagement 5-7, 12, 18, 24, 25, 27, 28, 30-33, 41, 46, 51, 53, 55-58, 67, 71-73, 75, 77, 78, defined as including in-person educational sessions or meetings, were only slightly more frequently effective at improving least one of the outcomes of interest than those that had only passive parent engagement 17, 19, 23, 34, 29, 38, 39, 40, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 68, 69, 74, 76, defined as exposure to print-based educational materials. The proportion of effective interventions using active methods of parent engagement was 72% (18/25) versus 67% (9/15) for those employing passive intervention strategies.

Table 4. Proportion of Effective Interventions by Component Combinations

Number of effective interventions/number interventions that measured a given outcome (percent)

Category	Total number of interventions	Effective for any outcome	Effective for weight outcome	Effective for nutrition outcome	Effective for PA outcome
PA Only components	25	14/25 (56%)	3/9 (33%)	N/A	13/23 (57%)
PA Offered Only	9	5/9 (56%)	1/3 (33%)	N/A	4/8 (50%)
PA Offered + PA Ed./Env.	13	9/13 (69%)	2/7 (33%)	N/A	9/12 (75%)
PA Env. Only	3	0/3 (0%)	N/A	N/A	0/3 (0%)
Nutrition Only components	21	14/21 (67%)	1/5 (20%)	13/17 (76%)	N/A
Nut. Ed. Only	9	5/9 (78%)	1/3 (33%)	6/6 (100%)	N/A
Nut. Ed. + FB	7	4/7 (57%)	0/2 (0%)	4/6 (67%)	N/A
FB Only	5	3/5 (60%)	N/A	3/5 (60%)	N/A
PA + Nutrition	22	15/22 (68%)	10/19 (53%)	5/10 (50%)	7/16 (44%)
Nut. Ed.+ PA Ed.	3	3/3 (100%)	1/2 (50%)	1/1 (100%)	1/1 (100%)
Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.+ PA Offered	10	6/10 (60%)	4/10 (40%)	2/4 (50%)	5/10 (50%)
FB + PA Offered +/- PA Ed./Env.+/- Nut. Ed.	9	6/9 (67%)	5/7 (71%)	2/5 (40%)	1/5 (20%)
Only staff training	2	2/2 (100%)	1/1 (100%)	1/1 (100%)	1/1 (100%)
TOTAL	70	45/70 (64%)	15/34 (44%)	19/28 (68%)	21/40 (53%)

Interpretation example: Of the 25 interventions with PA Only components, 14 of the 25 interventions (56%) were effective for any outcome (weight, dietary/nutrition, PA).

**PA Offered Only**: Change in the quantity or quality of PA offered; no changes in PA environment and/or education delivered

**PA Offered + PA Ed. and/or PA Env.**: Change in the quantity or quality of PA offered, changes in PA environment and/or education delivered

PA Env. Only: Change only in PA environment

**Nut. Ed. Only**: Intervention offered only nutrition education; no changes in PA (offered, env. and/or ed.) or FB changes

**Nut.** Ed + FB: Intervention offered nutrition education and FB changes; no changes in PA (offered, env. and/or ed.)

**FB Only**: Modification of FB offered; no changes in PA (offered, env. and/or ed.) or nutrition education **Nut. Ed. + PA Ed.**: Change in nutrition education and PA education delivered

**Nut. Ed. + PA Ed. + PA Offered**: Change in nutrition education and PA education delivered, and change in quality or quantity of PA offered

FB + PA offered +/- PA Ed./Env.+/-Nut. Ed.: Modification of FB, change in quality or quantity of PA offered, and/or PA education/environment and/or nutrition education

Staff Training: Interventions that only included staff training

\* For more detail on definitions, please see Appendix 4: Definitions of Intervention Components (p. 61)

N/A= not applicable

Note: denominators may change, since not all interventions measured the different outcomes.

# ii. Additional Analyses

his section presents the results of analyses conducted to further understand why some interventions reported effectiveness while others did not. We describe findings for which there is ample (≥20 interventions) or sufficient (ten to 19 interventions) evidence available in the literature. Instances where evidence was limited (one-ten) interventions) are noted.

# E. Number of intervention components

Interventions with three to five components were most frequently effective for nutrition and PA outcomes. Interventions with more than or equal to six components were most frequently effective for weight status outcomes.

We examined whether there was a difference in the number of components as described in Table 2 (i.e. *Nut. Ed., Meal FB, FB Outside Meals, PA Offered, PA Env., PA Ed., Screen Time, Parent Engagement,* and *Policy*) included in effective relative to null interventions, for any state objective and for each of the three main outcome categories (PA, nutrition, and weight-related). The number of components was categorized as follows (Table 5):

• Few: ≤2 components

• Moderate: 3-5 components

• Many: ≥6 components

- With regard to nutrition and PA outcomes, interventions with a moderate number of components were the most consistently effective.
- With regard to weight outcomes, interventions with the most components were the most effective.

 However, given the lack of linearity and the unequal number of interventions in each category, it appears the number of components alone may not have a consistent influence on intervention outcomes.

Table 5. Proportion of effective interventions by number of intervention components

Number of effective interventions/number interventions that measured a given outcome (percent)

Component count category (n=# Intx)	Effective for any state objectives	Effective for nutrition outcomes	Effective for PA outcomes	Effective for weight outcomes
Few (n=23 Intx)	12/23 (52%)	5/8 (63%)	6/12 (50%)	4/8 (50%)
Moderate (n=33 Intx)	24/33 (72%)	8/10 (80%)	11/20 (55%)	6/18 (33%)
Many (n=12 Intx)	8/12 (67%)	3/6 (50%)	3/8 (38%)	6/10 (60%)

Interpretation example: Of the eight interventions with few components, five of the eight (63%) that targeted nutrition outcomes were effective.

# F. Outcome measured and targeted

Interventions that measured fruit and vegetable outcomes were the most common and the most consistently effective; 65% of these studies demonstrated an improvement (Table 6). The impact of the interventions on other foods was less frequently studied and was less consistently effective (improvements occurred in 50% or fewer of the studies).

Table 6. Proportion of interventions that were effective by type of nutrition outcome

Outcome	Number of effective/number of measured a given outcome (%)			
Fruits and Vegetables	12/19 (63%)			
Added Sugar	2/8 (25%)			
Meal Quality	2/4 (50%)			
Snack Quality	3/6 (50%)			
Energy Intake	2/7 (28%)			
Interpretation example: Of the 19 interventions that measured fruits and vegetables offered or consumed, 12 (63%) were effective.				

Interventions tended to be less effective at improving BMI-related outcomes and most frequently effective at improving measures of body fat (Table 7).

Table 7. Proportion of interventions that were effective by type of weight status outcome measure

Outcome	Number of effective interventions/number of interventions that measure a given outcome (%)			
BMI	6/21 (29%)			
BMI z-score	5/13 (28%)			
Skinfold	4/12 (33%)			
% Body Fat	5/9 (56%)			
Waist Circumference	1/5 (20%)			
Overweight prevalence 0/2				
Interpretation example: Of the 21 interventions that measured BMI, six				

were effective (29%).

Interventions that targeted a given outcome, much more frequently impacted that outcome than those that did not target that outcome (Table 8). Interventions that targeted nutrition outcomes were more than twice as likely to improve dietary intake, interventions that targeted PA outcomes were about 70% more likely to impact PA, and interventions that targeted weight outcomes were over seven times more likely to improve body weight. Conscious targeting of outcomes appears to be a critical aspect of successful interventions, especially those targeting weight outcomes.

Table 8. Proportion of effective interventions by whether or not the outcome was a target of the intervention

	Number of effective interventions/ number interventions that targeted (or not) the outcome measured (%)					
	Nutrition outcomes PA outcomes Weight outcom					
Targeted	15/20 (75%)	18/33 (55%)	13/22 (59%)			
Didn't target	1/3 (33%)	2/6 (33%)	1/12 (8%)			

Interpretation example: Of the 20 interventions that targeted nutrition outcomes, 15(75%) were effective at improving a nutrition outcome.

# G. Time period for outcome measure and duration of intervention

Interventions tended to be most effective when they measured PA or dietary intake over a shorter time period (e.g. PA during recess or dietary intake during one meal) (Table 9). This effect was more pronounced with regard to PA. This suggests that PA interventions are more likely to have an impact over a short time period, and it may be more challenging to have an impact on overall PA levels. It may therefore be important to measure impact on PA throughout the day to ensure that the additional PA is adding to total daily PA and not just replacing other PA. For dietary intake, the interaction of time and effect was less consistent and therefore inconclusive.

Table 9. Proportion of effective interventions by time period for outcome measured

Number of effective interventions/number interventions that measured a given outcome (percent)

Measure		Total day	During ECE day	During recess/play period or meal
#	PA	8/20 (40%)	7/14(50%)	6/10 (60%)
Effective	Dietary intake	5/8 (63%)	7/13(54%)	10/14 (67%)

Interpretation example: Of the 8 interventions that measured dietary intake for a whole day, 5 (63%) were effective at improving a targeted outcome.

# **Conclusions and Recommendations**

To date, the published evaluations of ECE interventions to prevent obesity and promote nutrition and physical activity among young children suggest elements that show promise for achieving these goals. The evidence base is incomplete and is evolving, with more attention now being paid to interventions for young children. The following conclusions and recommendations drawn from the current literature should be reviewed as the body of published evaluations increases, particularly of interventions directed at low-income groups, FB interventions, and interventions aiming to change BMI.

The bullet lists below describe what we discerned from the literature are the critical elements of ECE interventions for the promotion of healthy eating, active living and healthy weight. All of the recommendations are likely applicable to SNAP-Ed work since many of the studies include low-income populations. No recommendations are based on studies conducted solely among higher income groups. The recommendations support the current SNAP-Ed approach in California which advises the combination of education and policy, systems and environmental change (PSE). In the ECE setting, comprehensive approaches that include the elements outlined below are the most likely to produce measurable outcomes targeted by SNAP-Ed in California.

• Interventions that target **PA Only** are the most consistently effective at increasing PA; interventions that target only nutrition are the most consistently effective at improving dietary intake, and interventions that address both nutrition <u>and</u> PA are the most consistently effective at improving body weight. Although neither **PA Only** nor **Nutrition Only** interventions consistently impacted weight related outcomes, **PA Only** interventions appeared to be slightly more effective than nutrition only interventions. While the studies did not explore the reason for this difference, it may be related to the healthfulness of ECE site offerings resulting in less room for improvement for nutrition compared to physical activity. Deliberate targeting of an outcome appears to increase the probability of achieving that outcome. For example, interventions that targeted healthy weight were much more likely to improve body weight than those that did not.

<sup>\*</sup>Of note, none of the intervention evaluations in this table accounted for foods and beverages brought from home. Most of the interventions that were effective for weight outcomes had a duration of six months or more suggesting that to impact weight outcomes an intervention should last for at least 6 months.

#### Recommendations:

- o If improvement in body weight is a primary objective, interventions should be consciously designed to address body weight and should include both PA and nutrition components.
- o If increases in PA are desired, focusing exclusively on PA is likely to be the most effective.
- If improvements in dietary intake are desired, focusing exclusively on nutrition is likely to be the most effective.
- To increase PA, interventions should include:
  - Comprehensive parent engagement that includes a variety of activities, such as interactive education seminars and workshops on PA and nutrition, family events, engagement in project management committees, and at-home activities.
  - Multiple strategies, such as PA education, PA environment changes, improved quality of PA offered, and increased quantity of PA offered.
  - Increases in both quantity of PA and improvements in quality of PA offered.
- To improve dietary intake, interventions should include:
  - Both nutrition education and changes to FB offered
    - Nutrition education alone has not been shown to be effective with low-income populations and/or populations of color.
    - Limited changes to FB offered (in the absence of education or more comprehensive food and beverage changes) is not a consistently effective strategy; more substantial changes to FB offered and targeted education may be required to achieve effects
  - A robust nutrition education component
  - Active parent engagement (defined as including in-person educational sessions or meetings, as opposed to passive engagement, defined as exposure to print-based educational materials)
  - Policy approaches that include support for policy implementation, monitoring of performance and provision of feedback
  - A strong staff training component
- **To improve body weight** (especially among low-income populations and/or populations of color) interventions should include:
  - Both nutrition and PA components

- An increase both in time and quality of PA offered
- Changes to FB offered
- Improvements in PA offered plus some combination of PA education, PA environment changes and/or nutrition education
- Comprehensive parent engagement
- Sufficient duration (at least six months); longer tends to be better
- Wellness policies to support changes
- Duration: Generally, interventions that were implemented over a longer period of time (≥6 months)
  were more frequently effective at improving any outcome than those implemented over a shorter
  period of time. Duration seems to be particularly important at improving weight outcomes.
- **Staff training**: Having a strong focus on staff training was an important element when implementing nutrition interventions, particularly food and beverage modifications. This includes providing training, support, and feedback to teachers and other staff.
- Strong parent engagement: Strong parent engagement is an important component for most intervention categories. Generally, interventions with active parent engagement, defined as including in-person educational sessions or meetings and take-home activities, were more frequently effective than those that had only passive parent engagement, defined as exposure to print-based educational materials. Strong parent engagement is particularly important when implementing nutrition interventions.

## **Additional conclusions**

- Improving both the quantity and the quality of PA is generally more effective than modifying just one component.
- Providing playground equipment or other changes in the PA environment without modifying PA offered might not be an effective strategy to improve PA.
- Studies among low-income communities and/or communities of color (compared to white or higher-income communities) were less often conducted and less consistently effective at improving outcomes of interest, particularly PA.
- When implementing multi-component nutrition and PA interventions, providing strong training for teachers, child care providers and other staff, as well as technical assistance and monitoring, are important elements in promoting the effectiveness of the interventions.
- Even when nutrition and/or PA education interventions are effective at improving dietary
  outcomes among middle- and high-income children, they have proven less effective among lowincome children. This may indicate that either nutrition education in general is less effective
  among low-income children or that further tailoring of interventions for these population
  groups is needed. The scope of this review does not provide sufficient information to discern
  the types of modification to education programs that would be needed to improve effectiveness
  among low-income populations.

# References

(Papers referenced in literature review are listed here in the same order as Appendix 1 table)

- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). 2016. Early Care and Education State
   Indicator Report. Accessed from <a href="https://www.cdc.gov/obesity/downloads/early-care-education-report.pdf">https://www.cdc.gov/obesity/downloads/early-care-education-report.pdf</a> on September 28, 2018.
- Office of Disease Prevention and Health Promotion (ODPHP). 2018. Nutrition and Weight Status-Healthy People 2020. Accessed from <a href="https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/law-and-health-policy/topic/nutrition-and-weight-status">https://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/law-and-health-policy/topic/nutrition-and-weight-status</a> on September 28, 2018.
- 3. Ritchie, L.D., Yoshida, S., Sharma, S., Patel, A.; Homel Vitale, E., Hecht, K. Drinking Water in California Child Care Sites Before and After 2011-2012 Beverage Policy. 2015 Jun;12(E89): 1-9.
- 4. The World Bank. 2018. How Does the World Bank Classify Countries? The World Bank Data Help Desk. Accessed from: <a href="https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/378834-how-does-the-world-bank-classify-countries">https://datahelpdesk.worldbank.org/knowledgebase/articles/378834-how-does-the-world-bank-classify-countries</a> on September 28, 2018.
- 5. Adams, J., Zask, A., Dietrich, U. Tooty fruity vegie in preschools: an obesity prevention intervention in preschools targeting children's movement skills and eating behaviours. Health Promot J Austr. 2009 Aug;20(2):112-9.
- 6. Zask, A., Adams, J.K., Brooks, L.O., Hughes, D.F. Tooty fruity vegie: an obesity prevention intervention evaluation in Australian preschools. Health Promot J Austr. 2012 Apr;23(1):10-5.
- 7. Barnett, L.M., Zask, A., Rose, L., Hughes, D., Adams, J. Three year follow-Up of an early childhood intervention: what about physical activity and weight status? J Phys Act Health. 2015 Mar;12(3):319-21. doi: 10.1123/jpah.2013-0419. Epub 2014 May 6.
- 8. Alhassan, S., Sirard, J. R., Robinson, T. N. The effects of increasing outdoor play time on physical activity in Latino preschool children. Int J Pediatr Obes. 2007;2(3):153-8.
- 9. Alhassan, S., Nwaokelemeh, O., Ghazarian, M., Roberts, J., Mendoza, A., Shitole, S. Effects of locomotor skill program on minority preschoolers' physical activity levels. Pediatr Exerc Sci. 2012 Aug;24(3):435-49.
- 10. Alhassan S, Nwaokelemeh O, Lyden K, et al. A pilot study to examine the effect of additional structured outdoor playtime on preschoolers' physical activity levels. Child Care Pract. 2013;19:23–35. doi: 10.1080/13575279.2012.712034.
- 11. Alhassan, S., Nwaokelemeh, O., Mendoza, A., Shitole, S., Puleo, E., Pfeiffer, K. A., Whitt-Glover, M. C. Feasibility and Effects of Short Activity Breaks for Increasing Preschool-Age Children's Physical Activity Levels. J Sch Health. 2016 Jul;86(7):526-33. doi: 10.1111/josh.12403.

- 12. Alkon A., Crowley A.A., Neelon S.E., Hill S., Pan Y., Nguyen V., Rose R., Savage E., Forestieri N., Shipman L., Kotch JB. Nutrition and physical activity randomized control trial in child care centers improves knowledge, policies, and children's body mass index. BMC Public Health. 2014 Mar 1;14:215. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-14-215.
- 13. Annesi, J. J., Smith, A. E., Tennant, G. A. Reducing high BMI in African American preschoolers: effects of a behavior-based physical activity intervention on caloric expenditure. South Med J. 2013 Aug;106(8):456-9. doi: 10.1097/SMJ.0b013e3182a05bef.
- 14. Annesi, J. J., Smith, A. E., Tennant, G. A. Effects of the Start For Life treatment on physical activity in primarily African American preschool children of ages 3–5 years. Psychol Health Med. 2013;18(3):300-9. doi: 10.1080/13548506.2012.712704. Epub 2012 Aug 13.
- 15. Annesi, J.J., Smith, A.E., Tennant, G. Cognitive-behavioural physical activity treatment in African-American pre-schoolers: effects of age, sex, and BMI. J Paediatr Child Health. 2013 Feb;49(2):E128-32. doi: 10.1111/jpc.12082. Epub 2013 Jan 31.
- 16. Annesi, J.J., Smith, A.E., Tennant, G.A. Effects of a cognitive-behaviorally based physical activity treatment for 4- and 5-year-old children attending US preschools. Int J Behav Med. 2013 Dec;20(4):562-6. doi: 10.1007/s12529-013-9361-7.
- 17. Başkale, H., Bahar, Z. Outcomes of nutrition knowledge and healthy food choices in 5-to 6-year-old children who received a nutrition intervention based on Piaget's theory. J Spec Pediatr Nurs. 2011 Oct;16(4):263-79. doi: 10.1111/j.1744-6155.2011.00300.x. Epub 2011 Aug 16.
- 18. Bell, A. C., Davies, L., Finch, M., Wolfenden, L., Francis, J. L., Sutherland, R., Wiggers, J. An implementation intervention to encourage healthy eating in centre-based child-care services: impact of the Good for Kids Good for Life programme. Public Health Nutr. 2015 Jun;18(9):1610-9. doi: 10.1017/S1368980013003364. Epub 2014 Jan 9.
- 19. Bellows, L.L., Davies, P.L., Anderson, J., Kennedy, C. Effectiveness of a Physical Activity Intervention for Head Start Preschoolers: A Randomized Intervention Study. Am J Occup Ther. 2013 Jan-Feb;67(1):28-36. doi: 10.5014/ajot.2013.005777.
- 20. Benjamin Neelon, S. E., Mayhew, M., O'Neill, J. R., Neelon, B., Li, F., Pate, R. R. Comparative Evaluation of a South Carolina Policy to Improve Nutrition in Child Care. J Acad Nutr Diet. 2016 Jun;116(6):949-56. doi: 10.1016/j.jand.2015.10.026. Epub 2016 Jan 6.
- 21. Benjamin Neelon, S. E., Finkelstein, J., Neelon, B., & Gillman, M. W. Evaluation of a Physical Activity Regulation for Child Care in Massachusetts. Child Obes. 2017 Feb;13(1):36-43. doi: 10.1089/chi.2016.0142. Epub 2016 Sep 28.
- 22. Binkley, T., Specker, B. Increased periosteal circumference remains present 12 months after an exercise intervention in preschool children. Bone. 2004 Dec;35(6):1383-8.
- 23. Bonis M., Loftin M., Ward D., Tseng T.S., Clesi A., Sothern M. Improving physical activity in daycare interventions. Child Obes. 2014 Aug;10(4):334-41. doi: 10.1089/chi.2014.0040. Epub 2014 Jul 23.

- 24. Bürgi, F., Niederer, I., Schindler, C., Bodenmann, P., Marques-Vidal, P., Kriemler, S., Puder, J. J. Effect of a lifestyle intervention on adiposity and fitness in socially disadvantaged subgroups of preschoolers: a cluster-randomized trial (Ballabeina). Prev Med. 2012 May;54(5):335-40. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2012.02.007. Epub 2012 Feb 21.
- 25. Puder J.J., Marques-Vidal P., Schindler C., Zahner L., Niederer I., Burgi F., Ebenegger V., Nydegger A., Kriemler S. Effect of multidimensional lifestyle intervention on fitness and adiposity in predominantly migrant preschool children (Ballabeina): cluster randomised controlled trial. BMJ. 2011 Oct 13;343:d6195. doi: 10.1136/bmj.d6195.
- 26. Cardon, G., Labarque, V., Smits, D., & De Bourdeaudhuij, I. Promoting physical activity at the pre-school playground: the effects of providing markings and play equipment. Prev Med. 2009 Apr;48(4):335-40. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2009.02.013. Epub 2009 Feb 21.
- 27. Cruz, T. H., Davis, S. M., Myers, O. B., O'Donald, E. R., Sanders, S. G., Sheche, J. N. (2016). Effects of an Obesity Prevention Intervention on Physical Activity Among Preschool Children: The CHILE Study. Health Promot Pract. 2016 Sep;17(5):693-701. doi: 10.1177/1524839916629974. Epub 2016 Apr 18.
- 28. Davis, S. M., Myers, O. B., Cruz, T. H., Morshed, A. B., Canaca, G. F., Keane, P. C., O'Donald, E. R. CHILE: Outcomes of a group randomized controlled trial of an intervention to prevent obesity in preschool Hispanic and American Indian children. Prev Med. 2016 Aug;89:162-8. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2016.05.018. Epub 2016 May 21.
- 29. Dennison, B. A., Russo, T. J., Burdick, P. A., Jenkins, P. L. An intervention to reduce television viewing by preschool children. Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med. 2004 Feb;158(2):170-6.
- 30. De Bock, F., Fischer, J. E., Hoffmann, K., Renz-Polster, H. A participatory parent-focused intervention promoting physical activity in preschools: design of a cluster-randomized trial. BMC Public Health. 2010 Jan 31;10:49. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-10-49.
- 31. De Bock, F., Genser, B., Raat, H., Fischer, J. E., Renz-Polster, H. A participatory physical activity intervention in preschools: a cluster randomized controlled trial. Am J Prev Med. 2013 Jul;45(1):64-74. doi: 10.1016/j.amepre.2013.01.032.
- 32. De Bock F., Breitenstein L., Fischer J.E. Positive impact of a pre-school-based nutritional intervention on children's fruit and vegetable intake: results of a cluster-randomized trial. Public Health Nutr. 2012 Mar;15(3):466-75. doi: 10.1017/S136898001100200X. Epub 2011 Aug 23.
- 33. De Coen, V., De Bourdeaudhuij, I., Vereecken, C., Verbestel, V., Haerens, L., Huybrechts, I., , Van Lippevelde W., Maes, L. Effects of a 2-year healthy eating and physical activity intervention for 3–6-year-olds in communities of high and low socio-economic status: the POP (Prevention of Overweight among Pre-school and school children) project. Public Health Nutr. 2012 Sep;15(9):1737-45. doi: 10.1017/S1368980012000687. Epub 2012 Mar 8.
- 34. De Craemer, M., De Decker, E., Verloigne, M., De Bourdeaudhuij, I., Manios, Y., Cardon, G. The effect of a kindergarten-based, family-involved intervention on objectively measured physical activity in Belgian preschool boys and girls of high and low SES: the ToyBox-study. Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act. 2014 Mar 14;11(1):38. doi: 10.1186/1479-5868-11-38.

- 35. Eliakim, A., Nemet, D., Balakirski, Y., Epstein, Y. The effects of nutritional-physical activity school-based intervention on fatness and fitness in preschool children. J Pediatr Endocrinol Metab. 2007 Jun;20(6):711-8.
- 36. Finch, M., Wolfenden, L., Morgan, P. J., Freund, M., Wyse, R., Wiggers, J. A cluster randomised trial to evaluate a physical activity intervention among 3-5 year old children attending long day care services: study protocol. BMC Public Health. 2010 Sep 8;10:534. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-10-534.
- 37. Finch M., Wolfenden L., Morgan P.J., Freund M., Jones J., Wiggers J. A cluster randomized trial of a multi-level intervention, delivered by service staff, to increase physical activity of children attending center-based childcare. Prev Med. 2014 Jan;58:9-16. doi: 10.1016/j.ypmed.2013.10.004. Epub 2013 Oct 18.
- 38. Fitzgibbon, M. L., Stolley, M. R., Schiffer, L., Van Horn, L., KauferChristoffel, K., Dyer, A. Two-year follow-up results for Hip-Hop to Health Jr.: a randomized controlled trial for overweight prevention in preschool minority children. J Pediatr. 2005 May;146(5):618-25.
- 39. Fitzgibbon, M. L., Stolley, M. R., Schiffer, L., Horn, L., KauferChristoffel, K., Dyer, A. Hip-Hop to Health Jr. for Latino Preschool Children. Obesity (Silver Spring). 2006 Sep;14(9):1616-25.
- 40. Fitzgibbon, M. L., Stolley, M. R., Schiffer, L. A., Braunschweig, C. L., Gomez, S. L., Horn, L., Dyer, A. R. Hip-Hop to Health Jr. Obesity Prevention Effectiveness Trial: Postintervention Results. Obesity (Silver Spring). 2011 May;19(5):994-1003. doi: 10.1038/oby.2010.314. Epub 2010 Dec 30.
- 41. Fitzgibbon, M. L., Stolley, M. R., Schiffer, L., Kong, A., Braunschweig, C. L., Gomez-Perez, S. L., Odoms-Young A., Van Horn L., Christoffel K.K., Dyer, A. R. Family-based hip-hop to health: Outcome results. Obesity (Silver Spring). 2013 Feb;21(2):274-83. doi: 10.1002/oby.20269.
- 42. Goldfield, G. S., Harvey, A. L., Grattan, K. P., Temple, V., Naylor, P. J., Alberga, A. S., Ferraro Z.M., Wilson S., Cameron J.D., Barrowman N., Adamo, K. B. Effects of Child Care Intervention on Physical Activity and Body Composition. Am J Prev Med. 2016 Aug;51(2):225-231. doi: 10.1016/j.amepre.2016.03.024. Epub 2016 May 11.
- 43. Gripshover, S. J., Markman, E. M. Teaching young children a theory of nutrition conceptual change and the potential for increased vegetable consumption. Psychol Sci. 2013 Aug;24(8):1541-53. doi: 10.1177/0956797612474827. Epub 2013 Jun 26.
- 44. Hardy, L. L., King, L., Kelly, B., Farrell, L., Howlett, S. Munch and Move: evaluation of a preschool healthy eating and movement skill program. Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act. 2010 Nov 3;7:80. doi: 10.1186/1479-5868-7-80.
- 45. Harnack, L. J., Oakes, J. M., French, S. A., Rydell, S. A., Farah, F. M., Taylor, G. L. Results from an experimental trial at a Head Start center to evaluate two meal service approaches to increase fruit and vegetable intake of preschool aged children. Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act. 2012 Apr 30;9:51. doi: 10.1186/1479-5868-9-51.

- 46. Hu, C., Ye, D., Li, Y., Huang, Y., Li, L., Gao, Y., Wang, S. Evaluation of a kindergarten-based nutrition education intervention for pre-school children in China. Public Health Nutr. 2010 Feb;13(2):253-60. doi: 10.1017/S1368980009990814. Epub 2009 Aug 4.
- 47. Huss, L.R., Laurentz, S., Fisher, J.O., McCabe, G.P., Kranz, S. Timing of serving dessert but not portion size affects young children's intake at lunchtime. Appetite. 2013 Sep;68:158-63. doi: 10.1016/j.appet.2013.04.013. Epub 2013 Apr 22.
- 48. Jones, R. A., Riethmuller, A., Hesketh, K., Trezise, J., Batterham, M., Okely, A. D. Promoting fundamental movement skill development and physical activity in early childhood settings: a cluster randomized controlled trial. Pediatr Exerc Sci. 2011 Nov;23(4):600-15.
- 49. Kirk, S. M., Kirk, E. P. Sixty Minutes of Physical Activity per Day Included Within Preschool Academic Lessons Improves Early Literacy. J Sch Health. 2016 Mar;86(3):155-63. doi: 10.1111/josh.12363.
- 50. Krombholz, H. The impact of a 20-month physical activity intervention in child care centers on motor performance and weight in overweight and healthy-weight preschool children. Percept Mot Skills. 2012 Dec;115(3):919-32.
- 51. Korwanich, K., Sheiham, A., Srisuphan, W., Srisilapanan, P. Promoting healthy eating in nursery schoolchildren: A quasi-experimental intervention study. Health Educ J. 2008;67(1):16-30. doi: 10.1177/0017896907083153.
- 52. Kling, S. M., Roe, L. S., Keller, K. L., & Rolls, B. J. Double trouble: Portion size and energy density combine to increase preschool children's lunch intake. Physiol Behav. 2016 Aug 1;162:18-26. doi: 10.1016/j.physbeh.2016.02.019. Epub 2016 Feb 12.
- 53. Morshed, A. B., Davis, S. M., Keane, P. C., Myers, O. B., Mishra, S. I. The Impact of the CHILE Intervention on the Food Served in Head Start Centers in Rural New Mexico. J Sch Health. 2016 Jun;86(6):414-23. doi: 10.1111/josh.12393.
- 54. Mo-suwan, L., Pongprapai, S., Junjana, C. H. A. O. N., Puetpaiboon, A. Effects of a controlled trial of a school-based exercise program on the obesity indexes of preschool children. Am J Clin Nutr. 1998 Nov;68(5):1006-11.
- 55. Natale, R., Scott, S. H., Messiah, S. E., Schrack, M. M., Uhlhorn, S. B., Delamater, A. Design and methods for evaluating an early childhood obesity prevention program in the childcare center setting. BMC Public Health. 2013 Jan 28;13:78. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-13-78.
- 57. Natale, R. A., Messiah, S. E., Asfour, L. S., Uhlhorn, S. B., Englebert, N. E., Arheart, K. L. Obesity Prevention Program in Childcare Centers: Two-Year Follow-Up. Am J Health Promot. 2017 Nov;31(6):502-510. doi: 10.1177/0890117116661156. Epub 2016 Sep 13.

- 58. Natale, R. A., Lopez-Mitnik, G., Uhlhorn, S. B., Asfour, L., Messiah, S. E. Effect of a child care center-based obesity prevention program on body mass index and nutrition practices among preschool-aged children. Health Promot Pract. 2014 Sep;15(5):695-705. doi: 10.1177/1524839914523429. Epub 2014 Mar 24.
- 59. O'Dwyer, M. V., Fairclough, S. J., Ridgers, N. D., Knowles, Z. R., Foweather, L., Stratton, G. Effect of a school-based active play intervention on sedentary time and physical activity in preschool children. Health Educ Res. 2013 Dec;28(6):931-42. doi: 10.1093/her/cyt097. Epub 2013 Oct 8.
- 60. Pate, R. R., Brown, W. H., Pfeiffer, K. A., Howie, E. K., Saunders, R. P., Addy, C. L., Dowda, M. An Intervention to Increase Physical Activity in Children: A Randomized Controlled Trial With 4-Year-Olds in Preschools. Am J Prev Med. 2016 Jul;51(1):12-22. doi: 10.1016/j.amepre.2015.12.003. Epub 2016 Jan 20.
- 61. Peñalvo, J.L., Santos-Beneit, G., Sotos-Prieto, M., Martínez, R., Rodríguez, C., Franco, M., López-Romero, P., Pocock, S., Redondo, J., Fuster, V. A cluster randomized trial to evaluate the efficacy of a school-based behavioral intervention for health promotion among children aged 3 to 5. BMC Public Health. 2013 Jul 15;13:656. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-13-656.
- 62. Peñalvo, J.L., Sotos-Prieto, M., Santos-Beneit, G., Pocock, S., Redondo, J., Fuster, V. The Program SI! intervention for enhancing a healthy lifestyle in preschoolers: first results from a cluster randomized trial. BMC Public Health. 2013 Dec 20;13:1208. doi: 10.1186/1471-2458-13-1208.
- 63. Peñalvo, J.L., Santos-Beneit, G., Sotos-Prieto, M., Bodega, P., Oliva, B., Orrit, X., Rodriguez, C., Fernandez-Alvira, J.M., Redondo, J., Vedanthan, R., Bansilal, S., Gómez, E., Fuster, V. The SI! Program for Cardiovascular Health Promotion in Early Childhood: A Cluster-Randomized Trial. J Am Coll Cardiol. 2015 Oct 6;66(14):1525-1534. doi: 10.1016/j.jacc.2015.08.014.
- 64. Reilly, J. J., Kelly, L., Montgomery, C., Williamson, A., Fisher, A., McColl, J. H., Lo Conte, R., Paton, J.Y., Grant, S. Physical activity to prevent obesity in young children: cluster randomised controlled trial. BMJ. 2006 Nov 18;333(7577):1041. Epub 2006 Oct 6.
- 65. Roberts-Gray, C., Briley, M. E., Ranjit, N., Byrd-Williams, C. E., Sweitzer, S. J., Sharma, S. V., Palafox, M.R., Hoelscher, D. M. Efficacy of the Lunch is in the Bag intervention to increase parents' packing of healthy bag lunches for young children: a cluster-randomized trial in early care and education centers. Int J Behav Nutr Phys Act. 2016 Jan 8;13:3. doi: 10.1186/s12966-015-0326-x.
- 67. Salazar, G., Vasquez, F., Concha, F., Rodriguez, M. P., Berlanga, M. R., Rojas, J., Muñoz, A., Andrade, M. Pilot nutrition and physical activity intervention for preschool children attending daycare centres (JUNJI); primary and secondary outcomes. Nutr Hosp. 2014 May 1;29(5):1004-12. doi: 10.3305/nh.2014.29.5.7316.
- 68. Sweitzer, S. J., Briley, M. E., Roberts-Gray, C., Hoelscher, D. M., Harrist, R. B., Staskel, D. M., Almansour, F. D. Lunch is in the bag: increasing fruits, vegetables, and whole grains in sack

- lunches of preschool-aged children. J Am Diet Assoc. 2010 Jul;110(7):1058-64. doi: 10.1016/j.jada.2010.04.010.
- 69. Sweitzer, S. J., Ranjit, N., Calloway, E. E., Hoelscher, D. M., Almansor, F., Briley, M. E., Roberts-Gray, C. R. Examining How Adding a Booster to a Behavioral Nutrition Intervention Prompts Parents to Pack More Vegetables and Whole Gains in Their Preschool Children's Sack Lunches. Behav Med. 2016;42(1):9-17. doi: 10.1080/08964289.2014.935283. Epub 2014 Oct 10.
- 70. Trost, S. G., Fees, B., Dzewaltowski, D. Feasibility and Efficacy of a "Move and Learn" Physical Activity Curriculum in Preschool Children. J Phys Act Health. 2008 Jan;5(1):88-103.
- 71. Vereecken, C., Huybrechts, I., Van Houte, H., Martens, V., Wittebroodt, I., Maes, L. Results from a dietary intervention study in preschools "Beastly Healthy at School". Int J Public Health. 2009;54(3):142-9. doi: 10.1007/s00038-009-8028-2.
- 72. Williams, C. L., Bollella, M. C., Strobino, B. A., Spark, A., Nicklas, T. A., Tolosi, L. B., Pittman, B. P. "Healthy-start": outcome of an intervention to promote a heart healthy diet in preschool children. J Am Coll Nutr. 2002 Feb;21(1):62-71.
- 73. Williams, C. L., Strobino, B. A., Bollella, M., Brotanek, J. Cardiovascular risk reduction in preschool children: the "Healthy Start" project. J Am Coll Nutr. 2004 Apr;23(2):117-23.
- 74. Williams, P. A., Cates, S. C., Blitstein, J. L., Hersey, J., Gabor, V., Ball, M., Kosa, K., Wilson, H., Olson, S., Singh, A. Nutrition-education program improves preschoolers' at-home diet: a group randomized trial. J Acad Nutr Diet. 2014 Jul;114(7):1001-8. doi: 10.1016/j.jand.2014.01.015. Epub 2014 Mar 22.
- 75. Winter, S. M., Sass, D. A. Healthy & ready to learn: examining the efficacy of an early approach to obesity prevention and school readiness. J Res Child Educ. 2011;25 (3):304-25. doi: 10.1080/02568543.2011.580211.
- 76. Witt, K.E., Dunn, C. Increasing Fruit and Vegetable Consumption among Preschoolers: Evaluation of Color Me Healthy. J Nutr Educ Behav. 2012 Mar-Apr;44(2):107-13. doi: 10.1016/j.jneb.2011.01.002. Epub 2011 Sep 16.
- 77. Yin, Z., Parra-Medina, D., Cordova, A., He, M., Trummer, V., Sosa, E., Gallion, K.J., Sintes-Yallen, A., Huang, Y., Wu, X., Acosta, D., Kibbe, D., Ramirez, A. Miranos! Look at us, we are healthy! An environmental approach to early childhood obesity prevention. Child Obes. 2012 Oct;8(5):429-39. doi: 10.1089/chi.2012.0125.
- 78. Zhou, Z., Ren, H., Yin, Z., Wang, L., Wang, K. A policy-driven multifaceted approach for early childhood physical fitness promotion: impacts on body composition and physical fitness in young Chinese children. BMC Pediatr. 2014 May; 14:118. doi:10.1186/1471-2431-14-118.
- 79. Must A, Anderson SE. Body mass index in children and adolescents: considerations for population-based applications. Int J Obes. 2006; 30:590–594. Accessed from https://www.nature.com/articles/0803300 on September 10, 2018.
- 80. California Department of Public Health- Nutrition Education and Obesity Prevention Branch. (2018). Accessed on September 12, 2018 from

 $\frac{\text{https://www.cdph.ca.gov/Programs/CCDPHP/DCDIC/NEOPB/Pages/EarlyCareandEducation-}}{\text{(ECE).aspx.}}$ 

81. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (2016). Defining Childhood Obesity | Overweight and Obesity | CDC. Accessed on September 10, 2018 from https://www.cdc.gov/obesity/childhood/defining.html.

# **Appendices**

Appendix 1. Intervention Characteristics	35
Appendix 2. PubMed Boolean Operator Search Strategy	70
Appendix 3. California SNAP-Ed Statewide Objective (SO) Outcomes	71
Appendix 4. Definitions of Intervention Components	72
Appendix 5. Effective Intervention Criteria	74
Appendix 6. Magnitude of Effects for Weight Status Outcomes	75
Appendix 7. Definitions and Acronyms	76

# Appendix 1. Study and Intervention Summaries

*Note*: Some interventions were examined by multiple studies; other single papers look at several intervention combinations. **Each row in the following table** always corresponds to <u>one intervention</u>, but may correspond to one or more studies. All applicable studies are listed in the first column.

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Adams et al., 2009	<b>Age:</b> 3-6y	Intx Name: Tooty Fruity Vegie	Diet: +
Zask et al., 2012a		, , ,	Researchers observed foods in lunch boxes
Barnett et al., 2015	Size:	Intx Description:	through lunch box audits:
	560 children with 1005	Nutrition Education: health professional visit (each	-Servings of FV: 0.61; <b>p=0.0013</b>
Study Design: cluster RCT	records total	term) - new food introduction - taste test, healthy	-% of children with 0 energy-dense nutrient-poor
	(10months):	cooking class, grow FV in gardens/pots	items in lunchbox: 29.1%; <b>p&lt;0.0001</b>
Intx Category: Nut+PA	# energy dense nutrient	Meal FB: policy that identified	-% of children with 2+ energy-dense nutrient-poor
	poor items in lunchbox:	appropriate/inappropriate foods for lunchboxes, water	items in lunchbox: -24.5%; <b>p&lt;0.0001</b>
Setting:	n=966 records (641 intx,	access policy	
Center, preschools	325 ctrl) (10 months)	FB Outside Meals: water access policy	<b>PA</b> : Ø
n=31 (18 intx, 13 ctrl) in	BMI z-score:	PA Education: games-based FMS development ('Fun	Measured by accelerometer:
Australia	n=936 records (621 intx,	Moves') (2 terms of 10 sessions - each session 2x/week	-MVPA: -0.11; p=0.913
	315 ctrl) (10 months)	& each term 2x/year)	
	Mean WC:	PA environment: playground env review and	Weight: +/Ø
	n=470 records (263 intx,	alterations, small grants for sports equipment	-BMI z-score at 10 months: -0.15; <b>p=0.022</b>
	207 ctrl) (10 months)	<b>Parent Engagement:</b> skills development, awareness-raising, social support, engagement in project	-WC at 10 months: -0.80; <b>p=0.020</b> -BMI at 3 years: -0.313; p=0.234
	BMI, WC, MVPA:	management committees, workshops, newsletters,	-WC at 3 years: -0.35; p=0.731
	n=111 children (61 intx,	nutrition education, PA education, ran cooking class,	
	50 ctrl) (3 years)	education on how to limit screen time	
		Policy: food/drink policies	
	Race/ethnicity: NR	Staff Engagement: engagement in project	
		management committees, ran cooking class, trained to	
	SES: NR	implement Fun Moves program	
		Intx Duration: 10 months	
		Follow-Up Times:	
		-# energy dense nutrient poor items in lunchbox, FV	
		servings: 10 months	
		-BMI z-score: 10 months	
		-BMI: 3 years	

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		-WC: 10 months and 3 years -MVPA: 3 years	
Alhassan et al., 2007	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intervention Name: NA	PA: Ø % time spent in PA-Accel-Total day:
Study Design: RCT	Size: n=33 (18 intx, 15 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 60 mins of extra recess time, 3 times/wk.	-Light PA: 0.2%; NS -MVPA: -0.1%; NS
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: Latino	Free play	Mins of PA-Accel-school time:
Setting: Center, Preschool		Control: received normal recess time	-Light PA: -0.1%; NS -MVPA: -0.1%; NS
n=12		Duration: 3 months	Mins of PA-Accel-After school:
Redwood City, CA, USA			-Light PA: 0.6%; NS -MVPA: 0.2%; NS
			Diet: NA Weight: NA
Alhassan et al., 2012	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intx Name: NA	PA: Ø % time spent in PA during total day, measured via
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=114 (69 intx, 45 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 30 min, 5 days/wk of locomotor skills	accelerometer: -Light PA: +1.4%; p=0.45
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: Latino and African American	activities (running, hopping, galloping, throwing, catching, kicking)	-MVPA: +2.9%; p=0.23 % time spent in PA during school day, measured
Setting: Center, Preschool	SES: Low SES	Staff: 8-hour staff training by a PE specialist  Control: 30 min of free outdoor playtime	via accelerometer: -Light PA: +2.9%; p=0.19
Springfield, MA, USA		Duration: 6 months	-MVPA: +3.4%; p=0.13
			Diet: NA Weight: NA
Alhassan et al., 2013	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intx Name: SPARK	PA: +/Ø % time spent in PA during total day, measured via
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=67(38 intx, 29 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 30 min of structured outdoor activities (3	accelerometer: -light PA: ANR; p=0.32
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: NR	days per wk).  Control: 30 min of free outdoor playtime (3 days per wk)	-MVPA: +1.8 mins; p=0.03 % time spent in PA during school day, measured via accelerometer:

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Setting: Center, Preschool n=2 Springfield, MA, USA	SES: NR	Duration: 1 month	-light PA: ANR; p=0.24 -MVPA: +1.6 mins; p=0.03 % time spent in PA-Accel-After school: -light PA: ANR; 0.08 -MVPA: ANR; 0.12
			Diet: NA Weight: NA
Alhassan et al., 2016 Study Design: cluster RCT	Mean Age: 4.1y Size:	Intx Name: Short bouTs of Exercise for Preschools Intx Description:	PA: +/-/Ø Observed % time spent in PA levels over one day during intervention time using a modified version
Intx Category: PA	n=248 (118 intx, 130 ctrl) (3 months) n=238 (120 intx, 118 ctrl)	<b>PA Offered:</b> structured PA (SBS-PA) in classroom setting (10 min gross-motor playtime + 20 min free playtime, 5 days/week)	of the Observational System for Recording Physical Activity in Children-Preschool Version: -Group by visit interaction for MVPA: 1.14; p=0.32
Setting: Center, preschool	(6 months)	Staff Engagement: SBS-PA led by teachers	-Group by visit interaction for light PA: 2.79; p=0.06
n=10 (5 intx, 5 ctrl); (16 classrooms in intx, 20 classrooms in ctrl)	Race/ethnicity: 41% Hispanic, 25% African American	Control Description: unstructured free playtime (30 min, 5 days/week)  Intx Duration: 6 months	-Group main effect for MVPA: <b>p &lt;0.001</b> -Group main effect for light intensity PA: <b>p &lt;0.001</b> Measured % time in PA level during preschool day by accelerometer:
Springfield, MA US	SES: NR	Follow-Up Times:	-Group by visit interaction for MVPA: p=0.03 – undesired effect
		-Total preschool-day PA: 3 months and 6 months -BMI: 6 months	-Group by visit interaction for light PA: 1.33; p=0.26
			Diet: NA
			Weight: NA
Alkon et al., 2014b	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Nutrition and Physical Activity Self- Assessment for Child Care (NAP SACC)	<b>Diet:</b> Ø Researchers observed center-level foods offered
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size: BMI:	Intx Description:	(lunch) using the Diet Observation in Child Care: -healthy foods: p>0.05
Intx Category: Nut+PA	n=209 (99 intx, 110 ctrl) Other Outcomes:	Parent engagement: "Raising Healthy Kids" workshop (at 7 of 9 CCCs), info sheets	PA: Ø
Setting: Center, CCCs	n=552 (248 intx, 279 ctrl)	<b>Policy:</b> develop/update CCC nut & PA policies <b>Other</b> : nut & PA posters displayed [nut ed/pa env or ed	

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
n=17 (9 intx, 8 ctrl)  CA, US CT, US NC, US	Race/ethnicity: Mixed (intx 55%, ctrl 37% White)  SES: low	Staff engagement: workshops (5/site), additional consultation/TA as needed, info sheets  Control Description: usual practice  Intx Duration: 7 months  Follow-up Times: 7 months	Researchers observed PA during the school day using the Observation System for Recording Activity in Preschools: -PA Type/Intensity: p>0.05  Weight: + -Child-level zBMI: -0.14; p=0.02 -Center-level zBMI: -0.26; p=0.02
Annesi et al., 2013a  Study Design: RCT  Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, Preschool- YMCA n=11  GA, USA	Age: 4-5 y  Size: n=273 (144 intx, 129 ctrl) Race/ethnicity: African American  SES: Low-income	Intx Name: Start for life  Intx Description: PA Offered: 30 min, 5 days/wk of structured PA. PA Education: behavioral skills based in social cognitive theory emphasizing self-efficacy and self-regulation Control: 30 min per day sessions of structured PA. PA did not differ in intensity or duration from the intx group.  Duration: 9 months	PA: + % time spent in PA during class time, measured via accelerometer: -VPA: +2 percentage points; p<0.05 -MVPA: +2 percentage points; p<0.05  Weight: + BMI-Measured by researcher: -BMI at 9 months: -0.19; p<0.05  Diet: NA
Annesi et al., 2013b  Study Design: RCT Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, Preschool- YMCA n=19 (8 ctrl, 11 intx)  Atlanta, GA, USA	Age: 2-5 y  Size: n=338 (202 intx, 136 ctrl)  SES: Lower to middle class	Intx Name: NA  Intx Description:  PA Offered: 30 mins, 5 days/wk, of structured PA.  PA Education: behavioral skills, goal setting, self- monitoring  Staff: Teachers received a 4 hour training  Duration: 2 months	PA: +/Ø % time spent in PA during total day, measured via accelerometer: -VPA: 9.3%; p=0.058 -MVPA: 8.7%; p=0.026  Diet: NA Weight: NA
Annesi et al., 2013c  Study Design: RCT  Intx Category: PA	Age: 3-5 y Size: n=275 (154 intx, 121 ctrl)	Intx Name: Start for Life  Intx Description:  PA Offered: 30 mins, 5 days/wk, of structured PA.  PA Education: behavioral skills, goal setting, self-	PA: + % time spent in PA during class, measured via accelerometer: -VPA: 1.37%; p=0.037 -MVPA: 2.65%; p=0.013

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Setting: Center, preschools, YMCA n=31 (21 intx, 11 ctrl)	Race/ethnicity: African American SES: NR	monitoring  Staff: Teachers received a 4 hour training  Control: 30 min per day sessions of structured PA.  Duration: 2 months	Diet: NA Weight: NA
Southeast USA			
Annesi et al., 2013d	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intx Name: Start for Life	PA: + % time spent in PA during class, measured via
Study Design: QE (non- random assignment)	<b>Size:</b> n=885 (716 intx, 169 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 30 min, 5 days/wk of structured PA.  PA Education: behavioral skills based in social cognitive	accelerometer: -VPA: +1.8 percentage points; p<0.001 -MVPA: +1.4 percentage points; p=0.016
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: 86% African American, 9%	theory emphasizing self-efficacy and self-regulation (goal setting, self-monitoring of incremental progress)	Weight: +/Ø
Setting: Center, Preschool  Southeast USA	Latino  SES: Lower to lower-	<b>Control:</b> 30 min per day sessions of structured PA. PA did not differ in intensity or duration from the intx	-BMI at 9 months: -0.06; <b>p=0.023</b> -BMI among overweight at 9 months: NS -BMI among obese at 9 months: -0.57; <b>p=0.028</b> }
Southeast USA	middle class	group.  Duration: 9 months	Diet: NA
Başkale and Bahar, 2011	Age: 5y	Intx Name: NA	Weight: Ø -BMI: NS
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=115 (67 intx, 48	Intx Description:	-Mid-upper arm circumference percentile: NS
Intx Category: Nutrition Setting:	ctrl)	<b>Nut Ed:</b> 6 weekly 20-30 min lessons guided by Piaget's cognitive development theory	Diet: NA
Centers, Nursery Schools n=12 (6 intx, 6 ctrl)	Race/Ethnicity: NR	<b>Parent:</b> Nut ed. session and educational booklet <b>Control:</b> usual nut ed. for children; mothers in intx and	PA: NA
Turkey	SES: Low, middle and high income	ctrl groups received nut ed.	
		Duration: 12 months Follow-up: 15-16 months	
Bell et al., 2014	<b>Age:</b> 3-6y	Intx Name: Good for Kids Good for Life Intx Description:	<b>Diet: +/Ø</b> Researchers analyzed menu contents:
Study Design: QE	<b>Size:</b> n=102 (50 intx, 52	Meal FB and FB Outside Meals: provided only non-	-High-fat, -salt and/or -sugar processed foods:
Intx Category: Nutrition	ctrl) menu changes	sweetened drinks (milk and water) and foods	p=0.001
Catting	n=431 (240 intx, 191 ctrl)	consistent with dietary guidelines and accreditation	-SSBs: p<0.001
Setting:	beverage practice	requirements	-Fruit servings: p=0.05
Center, Preschools	changes	<b>Parent:</b> participated in nutrition policy or programs.	-Vegetable servings: p<0.001

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
n=431 (n=240 intx, n=191 ctrl)  Hunter New England region of New South Wales Australia	Race/Ethnicity: NR SES: low-middle income	Control: No state-wide healthy eating initiatives at the beginning of the intx (2007), but after July 2008, preschool services in NSW could access support via a government program that promoted PA and healthy eating.  Duration: 20 months	Researchers analyzed menu compliance with guidelines: -No high-fat, -salt and/or -sugar processed food menu items: p=0.11 -No SSBs: p<0.001 -One fruit serving on the menu/day: p<0.001 -# vegetable servings on the menu/day is appropriate to hours open: p=0.01  PA: NA
Bellows et al., 2013	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: The Food Friends: Get Movin' With Mighty	Weight: NA PA: Ø
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=301 (98 intx, 103 ctrl)	Moves Intx Description:	Step counts measured via pedometer: -Steps/day: NS -Steps/week day: NS
Intx Category: Nutrition & PA	Race/Ethnicity: NR	PA: 15–20 min lessons 4 days/week (total of 72 lessons) comprised of multiple activities led by the classroom	-Steps/weekend day: NS
Setting: Centers, Head Starts		teacher. Each week focused on a gross motor skill and movement concepts introduced by characters.	Weight: Ø -BMI: NS
n=8	SES: Low-income	Nut Ed: Food Friends, a 12-week intervention shown to increase willingness to try new foods.	-BMI z-score: NS
Rural and urban sites, CO US		Parents: Materials sent home, including educational handouts and a copy of the Mighty Moves music CD.  Staff: Materials supporting the lessons provided as a kit; included a teacher activity binder, custom music CD, activity mats, flashcards, puppets, scarves, balls, beanbags, ropes, and parent materials.  Control: intx and control classes implemented Food Friends  Duration: 18 weeks	Diet: NA
Benjamin-Neelon et al., 2016a  Study Design: NE Intx Category: Nutrition	Age: NR Size: n=177 (99 intx, 78 ctrl) (measured 3 children/center)	Intx Name: NA Intx Description:	Diet: Ø Researchers observed foods served to children using the Diet Observation in Child Care & Environment and Policy Assessment and Observation:

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Setting: Centers, CCCs n=59 (26 intx, 33 ctrl)  Columbia, SC (intx) Raleigh, North Carolina (ctrl) US	Race/Ethnicity: Predominately Black intx group Approximately equal Black and White Ctrl Group  SES: Low	Policy: In April 2012, SC issued the following 13 compulsory nut standards for the ABC Child Care Program, a statewide subsidized care program:  1. Only skim or 1% milk for children ≥2y; 2. SSBs not served; 3. Juice allowed ≤1 4-oz serving/day; 4. At least 2 different fruits served 2 or more times per day; 5. Vegetable other than white potatoes served at least once per day; 6. Fried or pre-fried vegetables served once per week or less; 7. Whole-grain foods served once/day; 8. High-fat meats served twice/week or less; 9. Sweet food items served ≤ twice/week; 10. Staff attend nutrition training at least once/year; 11. Children learn about nutrition at least 1 time/week; 12. Food not used as a reward or punishment; 13. Create and consistently implement a written nutrition policy. The policy was administrative and not legislative.	- SSBs not served: OR=0.93; p=0.88 - Juice ≤1 4-oz serving/day: OR=1.19; p=0.86 - Fruits of ≥2 varieties served ≥2 times/day: OR=1.14; p=0.08 - Vegetables served ≥once/ day: OR=0.96; p=0.18 - Sweet food items served ≤2 times/week: OR=1.12; p=0.09  PA: NA Weight: NA
		Duration: 2 years Follow-ups: 3 years	
Benjamin-Neelon et al., 2016b	Age: 3-5y Size: n=324 (144 intx, 180 ctrl)	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: Policy: a state regulation passed in 2010 requiring 60	PA: Ø Researchers observed children's minutes of PA during the preschool day using Observation
Study Design: NE Intx Category: PA	(randomly selected 9 children from each center at each	minutes of light, moderate, and vigorous PA (LMVPA)/day for children in child care	System for Recording Activity in Preschoolers (OSRAP): -Light PA: -0.9; p=0.90
Setting: Centers, CCCs n=36 (16 intx, 20 ctrl) *4 intx centers dropped out	measurement)  Race/Ethnicity:  Majority white, but some representation of other	Duration:9 months Follow-ups: 3 years	-Moderate PA: -1.0; p=0.80 -Vigorous PA: -2.1; p=0.40 -MV PA: -3.2; p=0.54 -Light PA+MVPA: -4.6; p=0.46
Boston, MA (intx) Providence, RI (ctrl) US	racial/ethnic groups SES: Low Other: Mostly female (95%)		Diet: NA Weight: NA
Specker and Binkley, 2004	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intx Name: NA	PA: +/Ø

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
			Step counts per day measured via accelerometer
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=178	Intx Description:	at 12 months:
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: NR	<b>PA Offered</b> : 30-min sessions/day of structured PA. Activities such as jumping, hopping and skipping. <b>Control</b> : 30-min sessions/day of fine motor activities	-PA: p<0.05 % time spent in PA at 12 months: -VPA: NS
Setting:	SES: NR	that kept children sitting quietly and doing crafts.	Step counts/day at 18 months:
Center, day care			-PA: p<0.05
		<b>Duration:</b> 12 months	% time spent in PA at 18 months:
SD, USA		Follow-up: 12, 18 and 24 months	-VPA: p<0.05
			counts/day - 24 months: -PA: NS
			% time spent in PA at 24 months:
			-VPA: NS
			Diet: NA
			Weight: Ø
			Whole body scan with DXA
			-Total body % fat at 24 months: NS
<b>Bonis et al., 2014</b>	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: NAP SACC	PA: +
Study Design: cluster RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=209 (110 intx, 99	Intx Description:	PA level from 8:30a to 3:00p 2 days in 1 week measured by accelerometer:
Study Design: cluster RC1	ctrl)	Parent engagement: PA & nutrition materials	-MPA: p<0.05
Intx Category: Nut & PA	City	<b>Policy:</b> plan to improve 3-4 assessment areas	-VPA: p<0.05
	Race/Ethnicity: NR	Staff engagement: nutrition and PA education	-MVPA: p<0.05
Setting:		workshops (4 workshops/site)	·
Center, CCCs	SES: NR		
n=26 (13 intx, 13 ctrl)		Control Description: usual practice	Weight: Ø
Laudalama IIC		Late Departies Consents	-WC: p>0.05
Louisiana, US		Intx Duration: 6 months Follow-up Times:	-BMI: p>0.05
		6-9 months, depending on data collection schedule (for	Diet: NA
		all measures)	JEC IA
Burgi et al., 2012;	Mean age: 5.2	Intx Name: NA	Diet: +
Puder et al., 2011			Parents reported diet using a semi-qualitative
<u> </u>	<b>Size:</b> n=652 (333 intx,	Intx Description:	FFQ:
Study Design: RCT	292 ctrl)		-% healthy eaters: +1.9; p<0.01

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		Nut Ed: 22 lessons on healthy nutrition, media use and	
Intx Category: Nut+PA	38% low SES	sleep.	PA: +/Ø
		PA Offered: 45 mins, 4 times/wk. Aerobic fitness and	Counts per minute using accelerometer:
Setting:	Race/ethnicity: NR	coordination skills	-Total PA: -12.3; p=0.54
Center, Preschool		PA Environ: Fixed and mobile equipment (climbing	% active children:
	SES: NR	walls, hammocks, balls, cords or stilts)	-Reported PA: +1.9%; <b>p=0.04</b>
Switzerland		Staff: 3 hour workshops	
		Parents: 3 interactive information and discussion	Weight: +/Ø
		evenings about PA, healthy food, screen time and	Measured-BMI: -0.07; p=0.31
		importance of sleep	-WC: -1.0 cm; <b>p=0.001</b> -Sum of four skinfolds: -2.78 mm; <b>p=0.001</b>
		Control: regular school curriculum which included 1 45 min PA lesson/wk	-% overweight: 0.65; p=0.23
		mini PA lesson/wk	-% body fat: -0.07; <b>p=0.02</b>
		Duration: 11 months	-% body lat0.07, <b>p-0.02</b>
Condon et al. 2000a (como	A = 0 : 4   E : :	Intx Name: NA	PA: Ø
Cardon et al., 2009a (same	<b>Age:</b> 4-5y	Intx Name: NA	
paper as 2009b-c)	<b>Size:</b> n=291 (145 intx,	Intx Description:	% time spent in PA during 1 hour recess, measured via accelerometer:
Study Design: RCT	146 ctrl)	PA environment: provided playground equipment	-sedentary activity: 2.1; NS
Study Design. Net	140 (11)	ra environment. provided playground equipment	-light activity: 0.4; NS
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: NR	Staff engagement: made play equipment available,	-moderate activity: -0.2; NS
mex category.	nace, commercy. The	provided introduction to equipment	-vigorous activity: 1.3; NS
Setting:	SES: NR	provided mineralism to equipment	-average activity: 62.5; NS
Center, public pre-schools		Duration: 4-6wks	
n=20 (10 intx, 10 ctrl)			Diet: NA
, , , ,			Weight: NA
Flanders, Belgium			
Cardon et al., 2009b (same	<b>Age:</b> 4-5y	Intx Name: NA	PA: Ø
paper as 2009a,c)	,		% time spent in PA during 1 hr recess, measured
	<b>Size:</b> n=292 (147 intxB,	Intx Description:	via accelerometer:
	146 ctrl)	PA environment: provided playground markings	-sedentary activity: -1.1; NS
Study Design: RCT		Staff engagement: made play equip available, provided	-light activity: -1.0; NS
	Race/ethnicity: NR	introduction to equip	-moderate activity: -0.3; NS
Intx Category: PA			-vigorous activity: -0.12; NS
	SES: NR	Duration: 4-6wks	-MVPA: -0.7; NS
Setting:			-average activity: -38.9; NS
Center, public pre-schools			

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
n=20 (10 intx, 10 ctrl)			Diet: NA
Flanders, Belgium			Weight: NA
Cardon et al., 2009c (same paper as 2009a-b)	<b>Age:</b> 4-5y	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
,	<b>Size:</b> n=291 (145 intxAB,	Intx Description:	PA: Ø
Study Design: RCT	146 ctrl)	<b>PA environment:</b> provided both playground equipment and playground markings (intxAB)	% time spent in PA during 1 hr recess, measured via accelerometer:
Intx Category: PA	Race/ethnicity: NR	<b>Staff engagement:</b> made play equip available, provided introduction to equip	-sedentary activity: -1.7; NS -light activity: 0.5; NS
Setting:	SES: NR	4.1	-moderate activity: 0.8; NS
Center, public pre-schools		Duration: 4-6wks	-vigorous activity: -0.2; NS
n=20 (10 intx, 10 ctrl)			-MVPA: 0.8; NS
			-average activity: 11.3; NS
Flanders, Belgium			Weight: NA
<u>Cruz et al., 2016</u>	Mean Age: 4.1y	Intx Name: Child Health Initiative for Lifelong Eating	<b>PA</b> : +/Ø
	<b>2. 300 (000 )</b>	and Exercise (CHILE)	Caregiver reported on questionnaire:
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size: n=629 (309 intx,	Intu Description	-pooled PA at time 1: 1.63; p<0.05
Intx Category: Nut+PA	320 ctrl)	Intx Description: Nutrition Education: curriculum	-pooled PA at time 2: 1.56; <b>p&lt;0.05</b> -pooled PA at time 3: 1.12; p>0.05
mix category: Nut+PA	Race/ethnicity:	Meal FB: Head Start food service component	-pooled PA at time 5. 1.12, p>0.05
Setting:	~60% Hispanic	FB Outside Meals: food service component	Caregiver reported whether or not children
Center, Head Start	~40% American Indian	PA Education: curriculum	engaged in the following activities 'often' via
n=16 (8 intx, 8 ctrl)	107071111011101111111111111111111111111	PA Offered: activity breaks, 30 min PA sessions	questionnaire:
	SES: NR	Parent Engagement: family component, take-home	-ball playing at time 1: p>0.05
Rural New Mexico		materials, quarterly family events	-dancing at time 1: p>0.05
US		Staff Engagement: professional development training	-playing active games at time 1: p>0.05
			-jumping at time 1: p>0.05
		Intx Duration: 2 academic years	-walking at time1: p>0.05
			-ball playing at time 2: p>0.05
		Follow-Up Times:	-dancing at time 2: p>0.05
		multiple time points over two academic years:	-playing active games at time 2: p>0.05
		time 1: fall 08-spring09	-jumping at time 2: p>0.05
		time2: fall08-fall09	-walking at time 2: p>0.05
		time3: fall08-spring10	-ball playing at time 3: 1.9; p>0.05
			-dancing at time 3: 3.3; <b>p&lt;0.05</b>

Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		-playing active games at time 3: 1.3; p>0.05 -jumping at time 3: 1.5; p>0.05 -walking at time 3: 1.2; p>0.05  Diet: NA Weight: NA
Age: <4y	Intx Name: Child Health Initiative for Lifelong Eating and Exercise (CHILE)	Weight: ∅ -BMI at 7 months: 0.01; p=0.57
Size: n=1816 (945 intx, 871 ctrl)	Intx Description:	-BMI at 12 months: -0.07; p=0.06 -BMI at 19 months: -0.02; p=0.68
Race/ethnicity: ~60% Hispanic ~40% American Indian SES: NR	Meal FB: food purchasing, preparation, and serving by HS food service staff FB Outside Meals: food service component PA Education: curriculum PA Offered: add 30 min of PA to class activities (daily) Parent Engagement: take-home materials, family events (2x/school year) Staff Engagement: professional development training (quarterly)	Diet: NA PA: NA
A 2655-	health care provider component  Intx Duration: 2 academic years  Follow-Up Times: 7 months, 12 months, and 19 months	weight of
		Weight: Ø -BMI: -0.36; p=0.38
ctrl)	Nut Ed: 20 lessons on healthy eating Parent: home-based activities to reduce TV-viewing	-BMI z-score: -0.19; p=0.54 -Tricep Skinfold: -0.41; p=0.78
Predominately white	Control: safety and injury prevention program  Duration: 9 months  Follow-up: 12 months	Diet: NA PA: NA
	Age: <4y Size: n=1816 (945 intx, 871 ctrl)  Race/ethnicity: ~60% Hispanic ~40% American Indian  SES: NR  Age: 2.6-5.5y Size: n=78 (40 intx, 38 ctrl)  Race/Ethnicity:	Age: <4y  Size: n=1816 (945 intx, 871 ctrl)  Race/ethnicity: ~60% Hispanic ~40% American Indian  SES: NR  SES: NR  Age: day add to the training (quarterly)  Other - Community: local grocery store component, health care provider component  Intx Duration: 2 academic years Follow-Up Times: 7 months, 12 months, and 19 months  Intx Duration: Nutrition Education: curriculum  PA Offered: add 30 min of PA to class activities (daily) Parent Engagement: take-home materials, family events (2x/school year)  Staff Engagement: professional development training (quarterly) Other - Community: local grocery store component, health care provider component  Intx Duration: 2 academic years Follow-Up Times: 7 months, 12 months, and 19 months  Intx Description: Nut Ed: 20 lessons on healthy eating Parent: home-based activities to reduce TV-viewing Control: safety and injury prevention program  Duration: 9 months Follow-up: 12 months

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Rural communities in Upstate New York, NY US			
DeBock et al., 2010, DeBock et al., 2013	<b>Age:</b> 4-6y	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=826 (441 intx, 385 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 1hr gym class (2x/wk for 6 months), active transport, active games, outdoor excursions, gardening,	PA: +/Ø Accelerometer during 6 consecutive days: -mean accelerometer counts/15 sec: 1.38; .019
Intx Category: PA Setting:	Race/ethnicity: NR	hiking, dance  Parent Engagement: website, video, books, trainings (9 months)	min/waking day: -MVPA: .97; > p=0.1 -sedentary: -11; p=0.014
Center, Preschool n=37	SES: NR	<b>PA environment:</b> built parcours, tree house, play construction site	Weight: Ø Measured BMI: .064; p=0.41
Baden-Wurttemberg, Germany		Ctrl: 1hr gym class (2x/wk for 6 months)	-% body fat: 0.21; p=0.32
		Duration: 9 months Follow-up: 12 months	
De Bock et al., 2011	<b>Age:</b> 3-6y mean=4.26y	Intx Name: NA	Diet: +/Ø Caregiver reported child's intake (portions/day)
Study Design: RCT	Size: n=377 (intx, ctrl NR)	Intx Description:  Nut Ed: 15x2-hr sessions delivered by trained nutrition	via questionnaire: -Fruit: 0.23, <b>p=0.001</b>
Intx Category: Nutrition	Race/Ethnicity:	experts over 6 months  Parents: attended 5 of the nut ed. sessions provided to	-Veg: 0.15, p=0.27 -SSB: NS
Setting: Centers, Preschools	Roughly one-third of children came from an	children  FBs Outside Meals: offered healthy snacks (e.g., FVs	Weight: Ø
n=18 (8 intx, 10 ctrl)	immigrant background	and water)	-BMI: NS -Skinfold: NS
Southern Germany	SES: NR	Duration: 12 months Follow-up: 6 and 12 months	-Waist-to-height ratio: NS PA: NA
De Coen et al., 2012	<b>Age:</b> 3-6y	Intx Name: Prevention of Overweight among Preschool and school children project (POP)	<b>Diet:</b> Ø Parents reported children's daily intake via FFQ:
Study Design: RCT	Size: n=1102 for BMI outcomes	Intx Description:  PA: developed active playgrounds and implemented	-Fruit; p>0.05 -Veg; p>0.05
Intx Category: Nutrition & PA	n=694 for diet outcomes	health-focused PE	-Soft drinks; p>0.05

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Setting: Primary and Pre-Primary Schools n=31 Flanders, Belgium	Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: High, medium and low SES communities	Meal FBs & FBs Outside Meals: environ and policy changes to increase water (e.g., drinking fountains) and FV availability.  Policy: availability of water and FVs  Parents: Education, letters, posters  Other: Community meetings; distributed brochures and posters to practitioners, pharmacists, social services and community events; Regional Health Boards assisted with implementation at community and school	-Sweet and savory snacks: p>0.05  PA: Ø Parents reported children's PA (hours/wk) via questionnaire: -Participation in sports club: p>0.05 -Participation in after-school sports activities: p>0.05
		Duration: 2 years Follow-up: 2 years	Weight: +/ Ø BMI z-score by SES: -Total group: p>0.05 -High SES: p>0.05 -Medium SES: p>0.05 -Low SES: p<0.001
De Craemer et al., 2014	<b>Age:</b> 4-6y	Intx Name: ToyBox Study	PA: +/Ø
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: PA	mean=4.43y  Size: n=472 (301 intx, 171 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA Environ: classroom environment changes for PA, implemented throughout the whole school year.  Staff: 3 teacher training sessions; provided with the	Children's PA levels measured via accelerometer:  Total day: -light PA: -0.06; NS -MPA: 1.06; NS
Setting:	Race/Ethnicity: NR	"ToyBox", a box containing a teachers' guide (info on importance of PA), classroom activity guides,	-VPA: 1.11; NS -Total PA: 0.48; NS
Centers, Kindergartens,		newsletters, tip-cards, posters and a kangaroo hand	-MVPA: 1.07; NS
Daycare centers, and	SES: High, medium and	puppet.	Weekday:
Preschools (all referred to as Kindergartens in the paper) n=27 (15 intx, 12 ctrl)	low SES Communities	PA: Teachers were asked to allocate ≥1 hour/week to use the ToyBox-materials and to implement the ToyBox-intervention in the classroom. The PA part of	-light PA: -0.11; NS -MPA: 1.05; NS -VPA: 1.14; NS
Flanders, Belgium		the intx was implemented in weeks 5-8, and had a 2-week repetition period in weeks 19 and 20.  Parents: newsletters and tip-cards with strategies to increase preschoolers' PA levels and 1 poster (with key messages on PA that could be colored at kindergarten or at home) to take home for their parents/caregivers.  Control: standard curriculum	-Total PA: 0.65; NS -MVPA: 1.07; NS  Weekend day: -light PA: -0.09; NS -MPA: 1.02; NS -VPA: 1.08; NS -Total PA: -0.09; NS -MVPA: 1.04; NS
		<b>Duration</b> : 24 weeks for PA environment changes;	School hours:

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		6 weeks total (4 weeks on, 11 weeks off, 2 weeks on, 4 weeks off) for the in-class intx activities	-light PA: -1.02; NS -MPA: 0.45; NS -VPA: 1.02; NS -Total PA: 1.03; NS -MVPA: 1.05; NS  After school hours: -light PA: -1.18; NS -MPA: 1.11; NS -VPA: 1.31; p<0.05 -Total PA: 1.93; NS -MVPA: 1.18; p<0.05  Diet: NA Weight: NA
Eliakim et al., 2007	<b>Age:</b> 5-6y	Intx Name: NA	PA:+
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition & PA  Setting: Center, Preschool n=1 (2 intx classrooms, 2 ctrl classrooms)  Oranit, Israel	Size: n=101 (54 intx, 47 ctrl)  Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: Middle-high SES	Intx Description:  Nut Ed: Integrated nut into the curriculum via lectures/talks, games, books and workshops.  PA: 3x15-min PA sessions (45 min/day) 6 days/week, directed by a professional youth coach 2x/wk and by the teacher and/or assistant other times, indoors and/or outdoors, based on circuit training, designed to mimic the type and intensity of PA preschool children normally perform, primarily as games, mainly endurance activities, as well as coordination and flexibility.  Screen Time: study staff encouraged children to reduce sedentary activities (e.g., tv, video games)  Control: regular schedule  Duration: 4 months	Children's steps taken 9am-3pm measured via pedometer (average of two 3-day periods, 6 days total): -Steps/day: <0.003 -Steps/school day: <0.001 -Steps/afterschool day: <0.04  Weight: + -BMI: p<0.05 -BMI percentile: p<0.05 -% body fat (triceps and subscapular skinfold thickness): p<0.05  Diet: NA
Finch et al., 2010	Age: 3-5 years	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
Finch et al., 2014 Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=245 (120 ctrl, 125 intx)	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 20 min, 5 day/wk sessions of structured PA sessions. Opportunities for children to participate in PA	PA: Ø Step count using pedometer: -steps/min: 1.39; p=0.12

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, long day care services n=20 (10 intx, 10 ctrl)  New South Wales, Australia	Race/ethnicity: NR SES: NR	over the course of the day.  PA Environ: Portable equipment to children in indoor and outdoor areas  Screen time: fewer mins/day spent watching TV or using electronic media  Staff: Staff role modelling. Staff were asked to participate during active play  Duration: 6 months	Weight: NA
Fitzgibbon et al., 2005	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Hip-Hop to Healthy Jr.	PA: Ø Caregiver reported exercise frequency via
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size: BMI (and BMI z-score):	Intx Description: Nutrition Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min,	questionnaire: -% that exercised ≥7 times/week at 14 weeks:
Intx Category:	n=362 (179 intx, 183 ctrl)	3x/week))	0.59; p>0.05
Nut+PA/Screentime	(14 weeks) n=289 (143 intx, 146 ctrl)	PA Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min, 3x/week)) PA Offered: offered in curriculum (14-week (20 min,	-% that exercised ≥7 times/week at 1 year: -10.55; p>0.05
Setting:	(1 year)	3x/week))	-% that exercised ≥7 times/week at 2 years: 0.79;
Center, Head Start preschool	n=300 (146 intx, 154 ctrl)	Screen Time: lesson in curriculum	p>0.05
programs	(2 years)	Parent Engagement: newsletters (weekly), homework	
n=12 (6 intx, 6 ctrl)	Exercise frequency, Exercise intensity:	assignments (12)  Staff Engagement: administered curriculum lessons	Caregiver reported exercise intensity on questionnaire:
Chicago, Illinois USA	n=297 (143 intx, 154 ctrl) (14 weeks)	(14-week (40 min, 3x/week))	-Exercise intensity on Borg scale at 14 weeks: 0.14; p>0.05
	n=274 (132 intx, 142 ctrl) (1 year) n=261 (129 intx, 132 ctrl) (2 years)	Control Description: general health curriculum (14-week (20 min, 1x/week)), parent newsletters (weekly)  Intx Duration: 14 weeks	-Exercise intensity on Borg scale at 1 year: -0.29; p>0.05 -Exercise intensity on Borg scale at 2 years: -0.62; p>0.05
	Race/ethnicity: predominantly Black SES: NR	Follow-up Times: 14 weeks, 1 year, 2 years	Weight: +/Ø -BMI at14 weeks): -0.07; p=0.373 -BMI z-score at 14 weeks: -0.03; p=0.606 -BMI at1 year: -0.53; p=0.012 -BMI z-score at1 year: -0.23; p=0.006 -BMI at2 years: -0.54; p=0.022
			-BMI z-score at2 years: -0.18; <b>p=0.015</b> Effect size=-0.16

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
			Diet: NA
Fitzgibbon et al., 2006	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Hip-Hop to Health Jr.	PA: Ø
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size:	Intx Description:	Caregiver reported exercise frequency via questionnaire:
Study Design: cluster Ner	BMI (and BMI z-score):	Nutrition Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min,	-% that exercised ≥7 times/week at14 weeks:
Intx Category:	n=383 (196 intx, 187 ctrl)	3x/week))	0.28; p>0.05
Nut+PA/Screentime	(14 weeks)	PA Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min, 3x/week))	-% that exercised ≥7 times/week at2 years: 10.8;
Trace Try Server time	n=336 (176 intx, 160 ctrl)	PA Offered: offered in curriculum (14-week (20 min,	p>0.05
Setting:	(1 year)	3x/week))	p. 0.03
Center, Head Start preschool	n=331 (171 intx,l 160	Screen Time: lesson in curriculum	Caregiver reported exercise intensity via
programs	ctrl) (2 years)		questionnaire:
n=12 (6 intx, 6 ctrl)	Exercise frequency:	Intx Name: NA	-Exercise intensity on Borg scale at14 weeks): -
	n=323 (171 intx, 152 ctrl)		0.18; p>0.05
Chicago, Illinois, USA	(14 weeks)	Parent Engagement: newsletters (weekly), homework	-Exercise intensity on Borg scale at2 years): -0.30;
	n=293 (154 intx, 139 ctrl)	assignments (12)	p>0.05
	(2 years)	Staff Engagement: administered curriculum lessons	
	Exercise intensity:	(14-week (40 min, 3x/week))	Weight: Ø
	n=322 (171 intx, 151 ctrl)		-BMI at 14 weeks: 0.00; p=1.0
	(14 weeks)	Control Description: general health curriculum (14-	-BMI z-score at 14 weeks: 0.01; p=0.94
	n=293 (154 intx, 139 ctrl)	week (20 min, 1x/week)), parent newsletters (weekly)	-BMI at 1 year: -0.13; p=0.60
	(2 years)		-BMI z-score at 1 year: -0.11; p=0.29
		Intx Duration: 14 weeks	-BMI at 2 years: -0.20; p=0.49
	Race/ethnicity:		-BMI z-score at 2 years: -0.15; p=0.19
	predominantly Latino	Follow-up Times:	2
	SEC. ND	BMI and BMI z-score: 14 weeks, 1 year, 2 years	Diet: NA
	SES: NR	Exercise frequency and exercise intensity: 14 weeks, 2	
		years	
Fitzgibbon et al., 2011	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Hip-Hop to Health Jr.	Diet: Ø
Study Basisan L. 1. DOT	Ci	Lata Bassintian	Caregiver reported on foods consumed out of
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size:	Intx Description:	school on a 24-hour recall and researcher
Inty Catagony	BMI:	Nutrition Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min,	measured plate waste in school:
Intx Category: Nut+PA/Screentime	n=589 (309 intx, 280 ctrl)  Physical activity:	2x/week))  PA Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min, 2x/week))	-Kcals: 79.9; p=0.35 -Servings of fruit per day: 0.08; p=0.69
Nut+rayscreentime	n=190 (96 intx, 94 ctrl)	PA Offered: offered in curriculum (14-week (20 min, 2x/week))	-Servings of fruit per day: 0.08; p=0.69 -Servings of 100% fruit juice per day: 0.32; p=0.15
Setting:	Diet:	2x/week))	-Servings of 100% fruit juice per day: 0.52, p=0.15
Jetting.	Diet.	ZAJ WOCKJ	servings or vegetables per day, 0.00, p-0.36

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Center, Head Start preschools =18 (9 intx, 9 ctrl) Chicago, Illinois, USA	n=440 (238 intx, 202 ctrl)  Race/ethnicity: predominantly Black  SES: NR	Screen Time: lesson in curriculum Parent Engagement: newsletters (weekly), homework assignments Staff Engagement: training, administered curriculum lessons (14-week (40 min, 2x/week))  Control Description: teacher training, general health curriculum (14-week (20 min, 1x/week)), parent newsletters (weekly)  Intx Duration: 14 weeks	PA: + Time in PA measured by accelerometer: -Minutes of MVPA per day: 7.46; p=0.02 -Minutes of moderate activity per day: 4.78; p=0.05 -Minutes of vigorous activity per day: 2.83; p=0.03 -Minutes of MVPA per hours wore accelerometer: 0.53; p=0.02 Weight: Ø
		Follow-up Times: 14 weeks	-BMI: -0.08; p=0.28 -BMI z-score: -0.05; p=0.23
Fitzgibbon et al., 2013	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Family-Based Hip-Hop to Health	Diet: Ø
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size: BMI:	Intx Description: Nutrition Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min,	Caregiver reported on foods consumed out of school on a 24-hour recall and researcher measured plate waste in school:
Intx Category: Nut+PA/Screentime	n=143 (71 intx, 72 ctrl) (14 weeks) n=128 (61 intx, 67 ctrl) (1	3x/week))  PA Education: curriculum (14-week (20 min, 3x/week))  Screen Time: lesson in curriculum	-Kcals: -26.3; p>0.05 -Servings of fruit per day: 0.28; p>0.05 -Servings of 100% fruit juice per day:
Setting: Center, Head Start preschools n=4 (2 intx, 2 ctrl)	year) PA: n=46 (23 intx, 23 ctrl) (14	Parent Engagement: 6 90min classes (60 min education curriculum (nutrition and PA) + exercise session (30min)), newsletters (weekly)	-0.83; p>0.05 -Servings of vegetables per day: -0.18; p>0.05
Chicago, Illinois, USA	weeks) Diet: n=106 (50 intx, 56 ctrl) (14 weeks)	Control Description: general health curriculum (14-week (20 min, 1x/wk)), parent newsletters (weekly)	PA: Ø Time in PA measured by accelerometer: -Minutes of MVPA per day: 9.02; p>0.05 -Minutes of moderate activity per day: 2.78;
	Race/ethnicity: predominantly Latino	Intx Duration: 14 weeks  Follow-up Times: BMI: 14 weeks and 1 year	p>0.05 -Minutes of vigorous activity per day: 1.81; p>0.05 -Minutes of MVPA per hours wore accelerometer: 0.07; p>0.05
	SES: low SES - median income of \$15,000	PA: 14 weeks Diet: 14 weeks	Weight: -/ Ø -BMI at14 weeks): -0.04; p>0.05 -BMI z-score at14 weeks): -0.03; p>0.05 -BMI at1 year): 0.22; p<0.05

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
			-BMI z-score at1 year): 0.07; p>0.05
Goldfield et al., 2016	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: NA	PA: +/Ø Measured number of children spending ≥4 hours
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size: PA outcomes:	Intx Description: Staff Engagement: workshops (2 3-hr sessions),	in PA level for ≥2 days per week by accelerometer:
Intx Category: PA	n=88 (40 intx, 48 ctrl) Body composition/wt	training manual aimed at increasing PA through active play, booster sessions (12, 1-hr, biweekly)	-Total PA: 22.5; <b>p=0.002</b> -MVPA: 6.5; <b>p=0</b> .085
Setting: Center, child care n=6 (3 intx, 3 ctrl)	status outcomes: n=77 (35 intx, 42 ctrl)	Intx Duration: 6 months	-Light intensity PA: 16.1; <b>p=0.004</b>
Canada	Race/ethnicity: NR  SES: Mostly high income	Follow-Up Times: 6 months	Weight: +/Ø -BMI: -0.2; p=0.255 -BMI z-score: -0.12; p=0.225 -% body fat: -1.9; p=0.023 Effect size=-0.33 -Kg of fat mass: -0.3; p=0.018 Effect size=-0.15 -Kg of fat free mass: 0.2; p=0.126
			Diet: NA
Gripshover et al., 2013	<b>Age:</b> 4-5y	Intx Name: NA Intx Description:	<b>Diet: +</b> Researchers observed children's vegetable intake
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition Setting:	Size: n=40 (intx NR, ctrl NR) experiment 1 n=100 (intx NR, ctrl NR) experiment 2	<b>Nut Ed:</b> An "intuitive theory-based intervention" in which teachers read 5 story books during snack time and asked interactive questions (up to 2x/wk) that addressed 5 key concepts: dietary variety, digestion,	during snack: -Experiment 1: p=0.03 -Experiment 2: p=0.04
Center, Preschool		food categories, nutrients and nutrient functions.	
n=1	SES: High SES families	<b>Control:</b> The intx was tested vs 2 different control groups: 1) no-treatment and 2) an alternative	PA: NA Weight: NA
Palo Alto, CA US		treatment control group read books from USDA's Team Nutrition website on enjoying healthy eating and encouraging trying new foods, especially vegetables.	
		Duration: 10-12 weeks	
Hardy et al., 2010	Age: 3-5 years	Intx Name: Munch and Move	Diet: +/Ø

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nut+PA Setting: Center, Preschool n=15 New South Wales, Australia	Size: n=430 (167 ctrl; 263 intx)  Race/ethnicity: NR  SES: 47.5% low SES	Intx Description: Munch and Move Staff engagement: Increase staff confidence and knowledge to promote strategies within their centers that encourage children's healthy eating, active play, and fundamental movement skills.  Duration: 16 months	Researchers audited foods served during lunch: -Servings of SSB: -0.13; p=0.05 - Servings of fruit: -0.05; p=0.75 - Servings of vegetables: 0.12; p=0.16 - Servings of snacks: 0.06; p=0.75 %: -Balanced lunchbox: 0.85; p=0.72 -Unbalanced lunchbox: 1.18; p=0.72  PA: NA Weight: NA
Harnack et al., 2012a (same paper as 2012b)  Study Design: cross-over trial Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Center, Head Start n=1  Minneapolis, MN US	Age: 2-5y  Size: n=53 (intx, ctrl NA bc cross-over design)  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately Black (75.5%) SES: NR	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: Meal FB: Provided FVs before serving other items via family style during lunch Control: traditional family style lunch service  Duration: 2 weeks per condition	Diet: +/Ø Researchers observed children's lunch intake: -Fruit: 0.40; p<0.01 -Vegetable: 0.16; p>0.05 -Energy: 237.4; p>0.05  PA: NA Weight: NA
Hu et al., 2009  Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, Kindergartens n=7 (4intx, 3 ctrl)  Hefei, the capital city of Anhui Province, Eastern China	Age: 4-6y  Size: n=1,755 (1042 intx, 713 ctrl) parent-child pairs  Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: NR	Intx Name: NR Intx Description: Nut Ed: children received education sessions and nutrition-themed books Parent: education sessions, pamphlets, and posters displayed in kindergartens Control: children received a book of general picture stories.  Duration: 10 months Follow-up: 12 months	Diet: +/Ø Parents reported intake during previous week via FFQ: Children: -Unhealthy snack intake: p<0.05 -Western style high energy food intake: p>0.05 Adults: -Fast food intake: p<0.001 -Western style high energy food intake: p>0.05  PA: NA Weight: NA

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Harnack et al., 2012b (same paper as 2012a)  Study Design: cross-over trial Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Center, Head Start n=1  Minneapolis, MN US	Age: 2-5y  Size: n=53 (intx, ctrl NA bc cross-over design)  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately Black (75.5%)  SES: NR	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: Meal FB: Provider-portioned lunch service style Control: traditional family style lunch service  Duration: 2 weeks per condition	Diet: - Researcher-observed lunch intake: -Fruit: 0.25; p<0.001 -Vegetable: 0.11; p<0.01 -Energy: 284.5; p<0.001 *All statistically significant in a non-desirable direction  PA: NA Weight: NA
Huss et al., 2013a (same paper as 2013b)  Study Design: Cross-over trial Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Center, CCC n=1 (with 4 classrooms)  West Lafayette, IN US	Age: 2-5y  Size: n=23 (intx, ctrl NA bc cross-over design)  Race/Ethnicity: White (56.5%) and Asian (30.4%)  SES: NR  Other: Predominately male (74%)	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: Meal FB: Manipulated entree portion size (std vs 50% larger). Two meals (fish and pasta) were each served once/wk for 8 weeks in the various combinations (two 4-wk menu rotations).  Duration: 8 weeks Follow-up: 12 weeks	Diet: Ø Researchers measured children's plate waste during the lunch meal and estimated kcal intake from: kcal intake from: -Main course: NS -Dessert: NS -Total meal: NS  PA: NA Weight: NA
Huss et al., 2013b (same paper as 2013a)  Study Design: Cross-over trial  Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Center, CCC n=1 (with 4 classrooms)	Age: 2-5y  Size: n=23 (intx, ctrl NA bc cross-over design)  Race/Ethnicity: White (56.5%) and Asian (30.4%)  SES: NR	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: Meal FB: Changed timing of dessert (after meal as opposed to with meal). Two meals (fish and pasta) were each served once/wk for 8 weeks in the various combinations (two 4-wk menu rotations). When dessert was served immediately after the main course, the main course was removed from the table leaving the desert as the only food in front of the child.  Duration: 8 weeks	Diet: +/Ø Researchers measured plate waste during the lunch meal to estimate kcal intake from: -Total meal: 9% greater; p<0.01 -Dessert: 7% greater; 0.05 -Main course: 14% greater; p<0.04  PA: NA Weight: NA

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
West Lafayette, IN US	Other: Predominately male (74%)	Follow-up: 12 weeks	
Jones et al., 2011  Study Design: cluster RCT  Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, CCCs n=2 (1 intx, 1 ctrl)  Australia	Mean Age: 4.13y  Size: n=86 (46 intx, 40 ctrl)  Race/ethnicity: NR  SES: NR	Intx Description:  PA offered: structured PA during AM lessons, unstructured PM PA time PA environment: supports skills being taught PA education: movement skills development (3 20 min lessons/week for 20 weeks) Staff Engagement: in-person training/lessons (4 30min workshops) Intx Duration: 20 weeks Follow-up Times: PA: 19 weeks and 6 months BMI: 6 months	PA: +/Ø Counts per minute during the school day measured by accelerometer: -Counts/min at 19 weeks: 110.48; p=0.01 Effect size: 0.40 -Counts/min at 6 months: -38,31; p=0.25  % time spent in PA level during the school day measured by accelerometer: -light PA at 19 weeks: -0.06; p=0.97 -MPA at 19 weeks: -0.24; p=0.74 -VPA at 19 weeks: 0.56; p=0.16 -MVPA at 19 weeks: 0.26; p=0.82 -light PA at 6 months: -2.01; p=0.19 -MPA at 6 months: -1.06; p=0.14 -VPA at 6 months: -0.71; p=0.16 -MVPA at 6 months: -1.86; p=0.73
Kirk et al., 2016  Study Design: QE  Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, Head Start preschools n=2 preschools, =4 classrooms total (1 preschool (2 classrooms) intx, 1 preschool (2 classrooms) ctrl)	Mean Age: 4.1y  Size: n=54 (39 intx, 15 ctrl)  Race/ethnicity: African American  SES: low SES	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: PA Offered: activity lessons (2x/day, 30 min) Staff Engagement: teacher led lessons, training Intx Duration: 8 months Follow-Up Times: 4 months and 8 months	Weight: Ø -BMI: -0.8; p=0.53 Diet: NA  PA: + Researchers observed PA 2 times per day during activity lessons using SOFIT: -PA score at4 months): p<0.05 -PA score at8 months): p<0.05  Diet: NA Weight: NA

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Location NR			
Krombholz, 2012  Study Design: QE  Intx Category: PA  Setting: Centers, CCCs n=22 (11 intx, 11 ctrl)  Munich, Germany	Age: 4.6y=mean  Size: n=428 (211 intx, 217 ctrl)  Race/Ethnicity: NR SES: NR	Intx Name: NA Intx Description: PA Offered: At least one weekly 45-min PE session and other sessions of PA (mainly organized games as well as running, jumping, climbing, kicking, throwing and catching, at least 20 min. per day) on the other days. Indoor or outdoor environments were rearranged to be more activity friendly if necessary.  Staff: received education on benefits of PA for children, educational materials for implementing the PA, training to organize structured PA Control: regular curriculum consisting of one 45-min PA session/wk  Duration: 20 months	Weight: Ø -BMI percentile: NS -Skinfold thickness: NS  Diet: NA PA: NA
		Follow-ups: 11 and 20 months	
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, Nursery Schools n=16 (8 intx, 8 ctrl)  Muang District, Phrae Province Thailand	Age: 4-5y  Size: n=219 (135 intx, 84 ctrl) Race/Ethnicity:  SES: low-income  Other: mainly rural population	Intx Name: NA Intx Description:  Policy: nut policy for nursery schools created via a 4- step process: selection, advocacy, adoption and implementation. Policy-based activities included: nut guidelines, snack and beverage advising, changing availability of snacks at school shops and home, nut ed and activities, and focus groups with parents, teachers, local health officers, school board members and the public.  Parent: education on Thai RDA, involvement in policy development process, newsletters  Staff: teacher education on Thai RDA, involvement in policy development process, newsletters  Control: no intx  Duration: 9 months	Diet: +/ Ø/ - Researchers observed children's snack intake: -Cariogenic snacks: p=0.00 -Fresh fruit: p=0.13 -Thai desserts: negative outcome; p=0.01 -Crispy snacks: p=0.00 -Sugary drinks: p=0.17  PA: NA Weight: NA
Kling et al., 2016	Age: 3-5y mean=4.4y	Intx Name: NA Intx Description:	Diet: +

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Study Design: Cross-over trial Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, CCCs n=3 (11 classrooms)  University Park, PA US	Size: n=120 (intx, ctrl NA bc cross-over design)  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately White  SES: Middle-high income	Meal FB: Lunch was served once a week for 6 weeks.  Across the 6 meals, all items (food and milk) were served at 3 levels of portion size (100%, 150%, or 200%) and 2 levels of energy density (100% or 142%).  *100% is the baseline condition  Duration: 6 weeks	Researchers measured children's plate waste at lunch:  -Total energy intake at lunch: p<0.0001  -Both levels of portion size increase (150% and 200%) had a sig effect on energy intake (+49 and +66 kcal respectively; there was not a sig diff btwn the 150 and 200% conditions).  -Increasing meal energy density by 42% also had a sig effect on energy intake (+103 kcal).  -Increasing both portion size and energy density had a synergistic effect (+175 kcal in the largest portion + highest energy condition)
Morshed et al., 2016	Age: NA	Intx Name: Child Health Initiative for Lifelong Eating	Diet: Ø
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nut+PA Setting: Rural New Mexico US	Size: Center, Head Start n=16 (8 intx, 8 ctrl)*  Race/ethnicity: ~40% American Indian centers ~60% Hispanic centers  SES: NR  *unit of analysis was the Center itself	Intx Description: Nutrition Education: curriculum, taste tests Meal FB: food purchasing, preparation, and serving by HS food service staff FB Outside Meals: food service component PA Education: curriculum PA Offered: add 30 min of PA to class activities (daily) Staff Engagement: professional development training (quarterly) Parent Engagement: take-home materials, family events (2x/school year) Other - Community: local grocery store component, health care provider component Intx Duration: 2 academic years	Researchers observed food service offerings: -Servings of fruit: 1.02; p>0.05 -Servings of vegetables: 1.07; p>0.05 -Servings of added sugar: 0.94; p>0.05  PA: NA Weight: NA
		Follow-Up Times: 2 academic years	
Mo-Suwan et al., 1998	Age: mean = 4.5y	Intx Name: NA Intx Description:	Weight: +/Ø Measured BMI
Study Design: RCT	n=292 (147 intx, 145 ctrl)		-Triceps Skinfold Thickness (TSF): -0.17; NR

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, Kindergartens 2 Kindergartens n=10 classes (5 intx, 5 ctrl)  Hat Yai, Songkhla, Thailand	Race/ethnicity: NR SES: Middle SES	PA offered: morning walk (15 min) and afternoon aerobic dance (20 min) (3x/week)  Duration: 30 weeks	change over multiple time points - 0-30 wks: -WHCU slope: .86; NR -TSF slope: 1.31; NR girls: -BMI: -0.28; NR -WCHU: -0.26; NR change over multiple time points - 0-30 wks: -BMI slope: .32; NR boys: -BMI: 0.11; NR -WHCU: 0.1; NR change over multiple time points - 0-30 wks: -BMI slope: 1.08; NR
Natale et al., 2013,	Age: 47 months	Intx Name: HC2 - Healthy Caregivers, Healthy Children	Diet: NA PA: NA Diet: +/Ø
Natale et al., 2014b, Natale et al., 2017*	<b>Size:</b> n=1211 (NR)	Intx Description: Nutrition Education: curriculum (daily)	Parent reported child intake on the Healthy Kids Checklist: -Child FV intake score at1 year): 0.22; p=0.04
Study Design: cluster RCT	Race/ethnicity: 56% Hispanic, 33% Black,	Meal FB: part of policy FB Outside Meals: part of policy	-Child FV intake score adjusted for parent intake at 1 year: 0.11; p=0.07
Intx Category: Nut+PA/Screentime	7% White, 4% other	PA Offered: not clear if offered PA Education: curriculum (daily) Screentime: part of policy	-Child FV intake score adjusted for parent & teacher intake at 1 year: -0.21; p=0.34 -Child junk food intake score at 1 year:
Setting: Center, CCCs n=28 (12 intx, 16 ctrl)  Miami-Dade City, FL, US		Parent Engagement: training/nutrition education (1x/month for 6 months + 4 booster trainings/year for year 2 and 3)  Policy: healthy beverages, snacks, meals; encourage PA, limit TV/computer use  Staff Engagement: training/nutrition education (1x/month for 6 months + 4 booster trainings/year for year 2 and 3), delivered intx, visits with specialists (20 weekly)	-0.13; p=0.01 -Child junk food intake score adjusted for parent intake at 1 year: -0.08; p=0.13 -Child junk food intake score adjusted for parent & teacher at 1 year: -0.13; p=0.26 -Child FV intake score at 2 years: p>0.05 -Child junk food intake score at 2 years): p>0.05  Weight: + -BMI in model of trajectory over time at 2 years: - 1.95; p=0.04

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		Control Description: attention control safety curriculum (3x/year)	PA: NA
		Intx Duration: 1 school year (main intx), booster activities in 2nd year	
		Follow-up Times: Diet: 1 year and 2 year BMI: 2 year	
Natale et al., 2014a	<b>Age:</b> 2-5y	Intx Name: Healthy Inside-Healthy Outside (HI-HO) (modified)	PA: Ø Caregiver reported frequency over the past
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=307 (238 intx, 69 ctrl)	Intx Description:	month on questionnaire using questions extracted from NHANES:
Intx Category: Nut+PA/Screentime	Race/ethnicity: multiple	Parent Engagement: dinners (monthly), newsletters (monthly), at-home activities	-PA at6 months): p>0.05
Nut+FAy Screentime	race/ethnicities	<i>Policy:</i> modify menus, increase water availability, drink	Weight: ∅
Setting:	,	policy (substitutions/restrict access to unhealthy),	-BMI z-score at 3 months: p>0.05
Center, childcare	SES: low SES	snack policy (substitute), PA policy (increase PA,	-BMI z-score at6 months: 0.32; p>0.05
n=8 (6 intx, 2 ctrl)		decrease TV viewing)	-BMI z-score at12 months: -0.04; p=0.81
		Staff Engagement: training (2/center), curriculum*,	
Miami-Dade County, FL USA		technical assistance(weekly)	Diet: NA
UJA		Intx Duration: 6 months	
		Follow-up Times: 3, 6, and 12 months	
<u>O'Dwyer et al., 2013</u>	<b>Age:</b> 3-4.9 years	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
Study Design: RCT	Size: n=218 (115 ctrl, 103	Intx Description:  PA Offered: 60-min session 1 day/week with warm up,	PA: Ø Total day PA via accelerometer:
Intx Category: PA	intx)	dance, gym, games and cool down led by active play	-Light PA: 0.1; NS
	Race/ethnicity: NR	professionals and teachers.	-MVPA: -0.1; NS
Setting:	•	PA Edu: Posters displayed promoting PA	,
Center, Preschool	SES: Low-income	Staff: provide staff development and on-going support	Weight: NA
n=12	neighborhoods	for teachers who are not PE specialists. <b>Control:</b> delivered their usual PA provision.	
England		Control: delivered their usual PA provision.	

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		Duration: 6 weeks	
		Follow-up: 6 weeks, 6 months	
Pate et al., 2016	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: SHAPES (Study of Health and Activity in Preschool Environments)	PA: +/Ø PA time (mins/hr) during the preschool day
Study Design: RCT	<b>Size:</b> n=379 (191 intx, 188 ctrl)	Intx Description:  PA: (1) teacher-led structured in-class PA opps; (2)	measured via accelerometer: -MVPA: p=0.01
Intx Category: PA	Race/Ethnicity:	structured and unstructured PA opps at recess; and (3) PA integrated into pre-academic lessons.	-Light PA: p=0.34 -Total PA: p=0.79
Setting:	White: 39% ctrl; 44% intx	PA Environ: Social environment modifications included	
Centers, Preschools	Black: 42% ctrl; 47% intx	teacher verbal encouragement of PA, teacher	
n=16; 8 intx and 8 ctrl (4	Other: 18.9% ctrl; 9%	participation in PA, and inclusion of MVPA that children	
public and 4 private in each group)	intx	enjoy (e.g., dancing, chase games, ball games). Physical environment changes included supplies (e.g., balls,	
group)	SES: NR	music, scarves), use of space, materials, and existing	
Austin, TX	323. WK	equipment to engage all children in PA	
US		Staff: Researchers trained teachers to engage children	
		in PA and encouraged teachers to adopt the intx	
		<b>Duration</b> : 9 months	
Peñalvo et al., 2013a;	Age: 3-5 years	Intx Name: SI!	Diet: NA
Peñalvo et al., 2013b;			
Peñalvo et al., 2015	<b>Size:</b> n=2062	Intx Description:  Nut Ed: curriculum based, audiovisuals, books, games	PA: NA
Study Basisas BCT	Race/ethnicity: NR	and cooking workshops	Weight: +/Ø
Study Design: RCT	indee, comment, in the	Staff: 1 teacher for each school received a 30hr	Measured
Setting:	SES: NR	government-certified training on the program. Training	-BMI: ANR; p>0.05
Center, public schools		booklet and audiovisual material.	-3-year intervention subscapular skinfold z-score:
n=24 (12 intx, 12 ctrl)		Parents: informative letters and leaflets, Program SI!	-0.22; <b>p=0.039</b>
,		Website,	-2-year intervention subscapular skinfold z-score:
Madrid, Spain		Duration: 2 years	ANR; p>0.05 -1-year intervention subscapular skinfold z-score:
		Duration: 3 years	ANR; p>0.05
			-WC: -0.1; p=0.179
Reilly et al., 2006	Mean Age: 4.2y	Intx Name: MAGIC	PA: -/Ø
			Counts per minute during the whole day
Study Design: cluster RCT	Size for BMI outcome:	Intx Description:	measured by accelerometer:

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Intx Category: PA  Setting: Center, nurseries n=36 (18 intx, 18 ctrl)  Glasgow, Scotland	n= 481 (231 intx, 250 ctrl) (6months) n=504 (245 intx, 259 ctrl) (12 months) Size for PA outcome: n=285 (NR) (6 months)  Race/ethnicity: NR  SES: NR	PA offered: increase levels of PA, teach movement skills (3 30 min sessions/week for 24 weeks) PA environment: posters about increasing PA (walking & play) (6 weeks) Parent engagement: written PA education/screen time materials Staff Engagement: train 2 staff/site (3 sessions)  Control Description: usual curriculum	-Counts per min: p=0.18  % waking hours during the whole day spent in PA level measured by accelerometer: -MVPA: p=0.05, undesired effect  Weight: Ø -zBMI at 6 months: p= 0.87 -zBMI at 12 months: p=0.90
		Intx Duration: 24 weeks  Follow-up Times: BMI: 6 months and 12 months PA: 6 months	Diet: NA
Roberts-Gray et al., 2016	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y	Intx Name: Lunch is in the Bag	Diet: +/Ø
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition	Size: n=646 (349 intx, 279 ctrl) analyzed n=633 (341, 282) at	Intx Description:  Nut Ed: Lesson plan for: 1. daily teacher-guided lunch unpacking activity to facilitate teacher—child communication about food groups, and 2. activities	Researchers observed servings packed in lunches brought from home on 3 random, non-consecutive days:  -Vegetables at 6 weeks: p<0.001
Setting:	baseline n=608 (340, 268) at 6	requiring parents to send materials <b>Parents:</b> 5 weekly nut handouts and homework	-Vegetables at 22 weeks: NS -Vegetables at 28 weeks: NS
Centers, CCCs n=30 (15 intx, 15 ctrl)	weeks n=586 (330, 356) at 22 weeks	activities to inspire dialogue and assist parents in packing a serving from all 5 food groups; 5 weekly activity stations displayed in ECE facility to spark	-Fruit: p>0.001 at all 3 follow-ups -Sweets at 22 weeks: p<0.01
Austin, San Antonio and Houston, TX US	n=578 (325, 253) at 28 weeks	parent–child communication  Staff: session for teachers, materials to facilitate teacher–parent communication about lunches	PA: NA Weight: NA
	Race/Ethnicity: Predominately white (72%)  SES: Middle-high income (57% of families had	*This study amended the original intervention by creating a classroom activity in which children could earn a gold star certificate, branding the intervention with a squirrel character, and adding a booster week	
	annual income >\$100,000)	<b>Duration</b> : 6 weeks + 1 week booster 22 weeks later <b>Follow-ups:</b> 6 weeks, 22 weeks, 28 weeks	

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Roth et al., 2015  Study Design: RCT  Intx Category: Physical Activity  Setting: Centers, Preschools n=41 (21 intx, 20 ctrl)  Urban and rural areas outside 2 cities in Southern Germany	Age: 4-5y (mean: 4.7y)  Size: n=474-666 depending on outcome and f/u (too many figures to report) For main outcome of MVPA, n=598, 474, and 477 for 1st, 2nd and 3rd f/u respectively  Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: Predominately middle and upper SES (75-80%)	Intx Name: PAKT (Prevention through Activity in Kindergarten Trial) Intx Description: PA Offered: 30 min/day of teacher-led PA which included instruction for developing specific motor skills; children received PA homework and games to play with family Parents: 3 interactive lectures on healthy development, flyers Control: regular PA (no formal motor skill training and no PA promotion)  Duration:11 months Follow-ups: 5-6 mos, 11 mos (end of intx) and 13-15 months post baseline	PA: + Time (% total day) spent in MVPA measured via accelerometer: -Average over one week: 0.005; p=0.049 -Weekday-specific MVPA: 0.011; p=0.003  Weight: Ø -BMI post intx: 0.244; p=0.857 -BMI 2-4 post intx: 0.103; p=0.949 -Skinfold post intx: -1.548; p=0.272 -Skinfold 2-4 post intx: 0.305; p=0.846
Study Design: cluster RCT Intx Category: Nut+PA  Setting: Center, national day care centers n=4 (2 intx, 2 ctrl)  Santiago, Chile	Age: 4-5y  Size: n=265 (120 intx, 145 ctrl)  Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: low	Intx Description: Nutrition education: no details PA education: no details Parent engagement: training, workshops, written materials (screen time and energy-dense foods) Staff engagement: training and curriculum materials Intx Duration: 12 months Follow-up: NR	Weight: +/Ø Among obese: -zBMI: p=0.64 -skinfold thickness: p<0.01 -% body fat: p<0.01 -FMI: p<0.01 -FFMI: p<0.01  Among normal wt: -zBMI: p=0.56 -skinfold thickness: p<0.01 -% body fat: p<0.01 -FMI: p<0.01  FFMI: p<0.01  Diet: NA PA: NA
Sweitzer et al., 2010	<b>Age:</b> 3-5y	Intx Name: Lunch is in the Bag Intx Description:	Diet: +/Ø

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition Setting: Centers, CCCs n=6 (3 intx, 3 ctrl)  Austin, Texas US  Sweitzer et al., 2016  Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, CCCs n=3 (2 intx, 1 ctrl)  Austin, TX US	Size: n=132 (81 intx, 51 ctrl) parent-child dyads  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately white (~60%) followed by Asian (28%) SES: Middle-high income  Age: 3-5y Size: n=107 (59 intx, 48 ctrl) parent-child dyads  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately white (73%)  SES: Middle-high	Parents: handouts, menu and recipe suggestions, goal-setting activities, social references, and education stations  Nut Ed: arts, crafts, books, games, discussion, and educational stations  Staff: Teacher training  Duration: 5 weeks Follow-up: 6weeks  Intx Name: Lunch is in the Bag Intx Description:  Nut Ed: Lesson plan for: 1. daily teacher-guided lunch sack unpacking activity to facilitate teacher—child communication about food groups, and 2. activities requiring parents to send materials (e.g., empty boxes to build a great "grain train" around the classroom walls)  Staff: session for teachers, materials to facilitate teacher—parent communication about lunches  Parents: 5 weekly nut handouts and homework activities to inspire dialogue and assist parents in	Researchers observed servings in children's lunches brought from home:  Veg: 0.344; p=0.001  Fruit: 0.065; p=0.60  PA: NA  Weight: NA  Diet: +/Ø  Researchers observed FV servings packed in lunches children brought from home on 3 random, non-consecutive days:  -Vegetables at 6 weeks: p<0.001  -Vegetables at 26 weeks: p<0.001  -Fruit at 6 weeks: p>0.001  -Fruit at 26 weeks: p>0.001
		packing a serving from all 5 food groups; 5 weekly activity stations displayed in ECE facility to spark parent—child communication  *A booster week was added to the pilot intx activities  Duration: 5 wks+1 wk booster 20 weeks later  Follow-ups: 6 weeks and 26 weeks	
<u>Trost et al., 2008</u>	Age: 3-5 years	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: PA	<b>Size:</b> n=42 (20 intx; 22 ctrl)	<b>PA Education</b> : Opportunities for PA were integrated in curriculum, including math, science, language arts, and nutrition education.	PA: + Classroom PA measured via accelerometerMVPA: +2 mins; p<0.05
Setting:	Race/ethnicity: NR SES: NR	PA Offered: ≥2 PA activities lasting ≥10 min. offered 4 days/week.  Staff engagement: 3-hr training for teachers and staff.	-VPA: +1.5 mins; <b>p&lt;0.05</b> PA- Classroom + outside: -MVPA: +2 mins; <b>p&lt;0.05</b>

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Center, Preschool- Half-day n=1 Manhattan, KS, USA		Duration: 8 weeks Follow-up: 10 weeks	-VPA: +1 min; <b>p&lt;0.05</b> Weight: NA
	A 2.4		D: / d
Vereecken et al., 2009	<b>Age:</b> 3-4+y	Intx Name: Beastly Healthy at School	Diet: +/Ø
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, Preschools n=16 (8 intx, 8 ctrl)  Flanders, Belgium	Size: n=1063 (618 intx, 445 control) FBs avail during morning and afternoon breaks n=476 (308 intx, 168 ctrl) FB intake  Race/Ethnicity: NR  SES: NR	Intx Description:  Nut Ed: experiential (e.g., tasting), didactic, role modeling, feedback and reinforcement by teachers via stories and characters  FBS Outside Meals: increased availability of healthy foods at snacks and improved cooking equipment Parent: Newsletters, worksheets for children, evening and other school activities  Staff: Teacher trainings, manuals, digital learning environment, newsletters, group discussions; trainings for principals and cafeteria staff, on-demand help via email, feedback to schools  Duration: 6 months	Teachers observed FBs available during morning and afternoon breaks: -Fruit Juice: 0.04, p=0.629 -Sugary milk drinks: -0.07, p=0.391 -Fresh fruit: 0.09, p=0.161 Caregivers reported children's intake during the last year via FFQ: -Fruit Juice: -10, p=0.594 -Sugary soft drinks: -2; 0.822 -Sugary milk drinks: 9, p=0.458 -Fresh fruit: 9, p=0.039 -Vegetables: 3, p=0.485 (Units are ml for beverages and g for foods)  PA: NA Weight: NA
Williams et al., 2002	<b>Age:</b> 2-5y	Intx Name: Healthy Start	Diet: +/ Ø
Study Design: QE Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, Head Start n=9 (6 intx (3 in each of 2 intx conditions), 3 ctrl)  Upstate New York, NY US	Size: n=567 at 12 months n=144 at 24 months  Race/Ethnicity: predominately minority (41% black, 33% Latino)  SES: Low-income	Intx Description:  Meal FBs: food service modified to provide ≤30% kcal from total fat and ≤10% kcal from sat fat, while meeting USDA's reimbursable meal pattern, including for kcal.  FB Outside Meals: see Meal FBs  Nut. Ed.: Three intervention centers had nut education and 3 did not, but for the analysis, all 6 centers were grouped together.  Parent: Newsletters, meetings, take-home activities  Staff: cooks had 1-day training on menu planning, recipe development, food purchasing and prep; teacher workshop and booster sessions; in centers assigned to	Researchers observed children's plate waste during the school day: -Kcal intake at 12 months: -0.42; p<0.001 -Kcal intake at 24 months: p>0.05  PA: NA Weight: NA

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
		nut ed, dieticians worked with teachers to improve their knowledge, confidence and motivation.  Control: Food service change-only intx centers and control centers received additional safety ed. All groups received the nut ed in place prior to the study.  Duration: 2 years	
Williams et al., 2004	<b>Age:</b> 2-5y	Follow-up: 1 and 2 years Intx Name: Healthy Start	Weight: Ø -BMI: NS
Study Design: QE Intx Category: Nutrition  Setting: Centers, Head Start Centers	Size: n=676 (383 intx, 293 ctrl)  Race/Ethnicity: The majority of the Food	Intx Description:  Meal FBs: food service modified to provide ≤30% kcal from total fat and ≤10% kcal from sat fat, while meeting USDA's reimbursable meal pattern including adequate kcal intake.	Diet: NA PA: NA
n=9 (6 intx (3 in each of 2 intx conditions), 3 ctrl)	Service-Only group was White The majority of the Food	FBs Outside Meals: see Meal FBs Nut. Ed: Three intervention centers had nut education and 3 did not, but for the analysis, all 6 centers were	
Upstate New York, NY US	Service + Nut. Ed. group was Black. The majority of the control group was Hispanic.	grouped together.  Parent Engagement: Newsletters, meetings, takehome activities  Staff: cooks had 1-day training on menu planning, recipe development, food purchasing and prep, and changing offerings; teachers attended a training	
	SES: Low-income	workshop and booster sessions (in centers assigned to nut ed, dieticians worked with teachers to improve their knowledge, confidence and motivation)  Control: Food service change-only intx centers and control centers received additional safety ed. All groups received the usual nut ed.	
		<b>Duration</b> : 9 months	
Williams et al., 2014	Age: 4.4y=mean	Intx Name: Eat Well Play Hard Child Care Settings	Diet: +/Ø Parent reported (Questionnaire):
Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition	<b>Size:</b> n=902 parents (440 intx, 462 ctrl)	Intx Description: Nut Ed: lesson plans and activities	-Cups of vegetables consumed at home: 0.12; p<0.05

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Setting: Centers, CCCs n=24 (12 intx, 12 ctrl)  New York City, NY USA	child sample NR?  Race/Ethnicity: Mixed race/ethnicity  SES: Low	Parents: lesson plans and activities; each module included take-home materials and activities for parents to do with children.  Policy: center directors identified areas of policy improvement for enhancing nutrition.  Staff: RDNs taught ≥2 classes for staff to help them integrate the program's messages into classroom activities  Duration: 6-10 weeks Follow-up: 17 weeks	-Cups of fruit consumed at home: 0.06; p>0.05 -Cups of FVs consumed at home: 0.19p>0.05 -# days in the past week child helped self/requested vegetable as snack: 0.34; p<0.05 -# days in the past week child helped self/requested fruit as snack: 0.24p>0.05 -# days in the past week parent offered vegetable as snack: 0.25p>0.05 -# days in past week parent offered fruit as snack: 0.00p>0.05  PA: NA Weight: NA
Winter and Sass, 2011  Study Design: QE Intx Category: Nutrition & PA  Setting: Centers, Head Starts n=4  Large city in South Texas, US	Age: 3-5y  Size: n=405 (206 intx, 199 ctrl) n=131 (intx, ctrl NR) for PA  SES: Low-income  Race/Ethnicity: Predominately Latino (95%)	Intx Name: Healthy & Ready to Learn Intx Description: Nut Ed: health-themed storybooks PA Ed: health-themed storybooks PA Offered: activities with materials Parent: monthly sessions focused on motivating parents to engage in healthy behaviors, including increasing FVs and PA and reducing use of sweets as rewards. Promotoras assisted in trainings. Control: standard curriculum  Duration: 24 weeks	PA: Ø Researchers observed children's PA during teacher-led sessions using SOFIT: -SOFIT PA score: 3.42; p>0.05  Weight: Ø -BMI: B=-0.06; p>0.05
Witt and Dunn, 2012  Study Design: RCT Intx Category: Nutrition & PA  Setting: Centers, CCCs n=17 (10 intx, 7 ctrl)  Boise, ID US	Age: 4-5y  Size: n=263 (165 intx, 98 ctrl) n=153 (83 intx, 70 ctrl) fruit intake n=122 (70 intx, 52 ctrl) veg intake  Race/Ethnicity: NR SES: NR	Intx Name: Color Me Healthy Intx Description: Nut Ed: interactive lessons (3x15-30 min/week), with focus on FVs PA Ed: interactive lessons (3x15-30 min/week), combined with nut ed. Parents: newsletters  Duration: 6 weeks Follow-up: 3 months	Diet: +  Researchers measured children's plate waste (% of total served remaining) at snack: -Fruit intake at 1 week: d=1.29; p<0.001 -Fruit intake at 3 months: d=0.68; p<0.001 - Veg intake at 1 week: d=0.90; p<0.001 - Veg intake at 3 months: d=1.20; p<0.001

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
Yin et al., 2012	Age: 3-5 y mean=4.1y	Intx Name: Miranos! Look at Us, We Are Healthy! Intx Description:	PA: + Step score (total step count/duration of observed)
Study Design: QE Intx Category:	Size: n=276 (179 center-based intx, 97 ctrl)	PA: Teachers implemented a structured gross motor skills program during daily outdoor play time (30–45 min: 15-20 min structured and remaining time engaged	during play period measured via pedometer: p<0.05
Setting:		with children in free play) using Activity Cards with	Weight: Ø
Centers, Head Start	Race/Ethnicity:	lesson plans and equipment supplied by the study.	-Weight: -0.02 kg; p>0.05
n=3 (2 intx, 1 ctrl)	Predominately Hispanic (Mexican-American)-90%	Before the intx children had unstructured, free play while teachers monitored.	-Weight z-score for age and gender: -0.01; p>0.05 -BMI z-score: -0.04; p>0.05
San Antonio, TX		PA Ed: Sesame Street Workshop Healthy Habits for Life	
US	SES: low	(HHL) resource kit, a bilingual health education program with 9 activity modules with physical activities, hands-on games, and interactive DVD activities that can be integrated into daily routines. Supplemented HHL with movement music CDs and storybooks with PA themes.  Nut Ed: storybooks with nut the mess; tasting activities and contests to promote healthy eating (water, low-fat or skim milk, fruits, vegetables, and healthy snacks) during lunch and snacks.  Staff: research team trained teachers and staff to implement a gross motor skills program during daily outdoor play and nut activities  Duration: 18 weeks	Diet: NA
Yin et al., 2012	<b>Age:</b> 3-5 y mean=4.1y	Intx Name: Miranos! Look at Us, We Are Healthy! Intx Description:	Diet: + Researchers measured plate-waste of FVs at lunch
Study Design: QE	<b>Cina.</b> m=177 /00	PA: Teachers implemented a structured gross motor	on 3 consecutive days: 0.19 servings; <b>p&lt;0.05</b>
Intx Category: PA+ Nut	Size: n=177 (80 center + home intx, 97 ctrl)	skills program during daily outdoor play time (30–45 min: 15-20 min structured and remaining time engaged	PA: +
Setting:	nome mix, 97 cm)	with children in free play) using Activity Cards with	Step score (total step count/duration of observed)
Centers, Head Start	Race/Ethnicity:	lesson plans and equipment supplied by the study.	during play period measured via pedometer:
n=2 (1 intx, 1 ctrl)	Predominately Hispanic (Mexican-American)-90%	Before the intx children had unstructured, free play while teachers monitored.	p<0.05
San Antonio, TX		PA Ed: Sesame Street Workshop Healthy Habits for Life	Weight: +/Ø
US	SES: low	(HHL) resource kit, a bilingual health education program with 9 activity modules with physical	-Weight: -0.13kg; p<0.08 -Weight z-score for age and gender: -0.06; p<0.04

Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)
	activities, hands-on games, and interactive DVD activities that can be integrated into daily routines. Supplemented HHL with movement music CDs and storybooks with PA themes.  Nut Ed: storybooks with nut the mess; tasting activities and contests to promote healthy eating (water, low-fat or skim milk, fruits, vegetables, and healthy snacks) during lunch and snacks.  Staff: research team trained teachers and staff to implement a gross motor skills program during daily outdoor play and nut activities  Parents: 7 parent peer educators were trained to engage other parents during school dismissal period and hold poster education sessions; 14 newsletters; take-home activity bags  Duration: 18 weeks	-BMI z-score: -0.09; p<0.09
Age: 3-5 years	Intx Name: NA	Diet: NA
<b>Size:</b> n=357 (139 ctrl, 218	Intx Description:	PA: NA
intx)		Weight: +/Ø
Race/ethnicity: NR	All received 10 min exercise routine during recess.  PA Edu: PA curriculum for outdoor play	Bioelectrical impedance -Body fat %: -1.2%; p<0.0001
SES: NR	<b>PA Env</b> : portable play equipment to implement PE	-Fat mass (kg): -0.55; <b>p&lt;0.0001</b>
		-Muscle mass (kg): +0.48; <b>p&lt;0.0001</b> -BMI: 0.19; NS
	regulations and standards and to increase healthy	-BMI z-score: 0.15; NS
	eating choices  Staff: teachers, 20 hour training on child growth and PA. Food services workers, 6 hr training by dietitians about nutrition, menu design, nutrition standards.  Parents: Monthly health education seminars on PA and nutrition, monthly newsletters, interactive internet website for parents, family events.	
	Size: n=357 (139 ctrl, 218 intx)  Race/ethnicity: NR	activities that can be integrated into daily routines. Supplemented HHL with movement music CDs and storybooks with PA themes.  Nut Ed: storybooks with nut the mess; tasting activities and contests to promote healthy eating (water, low-fat or skim milk, fruits, vegetables, and healthy snacks) during lunch and snacks.  Staff: research team trained teachers and staff to implement a gross motor skills program during daily outdoor play and nut activities  Parents: 7 parent peer educators were trained to engage other parents during school dismissal period and hold poster education sessions; 14 newsletters; take-home activity bags  Duration: 18 weeks  Age: 3-5 years  Intx Name: NA  Size: n=357 (139 ctrl, 218 intx)  PA: 60 mins/day sessions for outdoor play for 3-years-old. 90 mins/day of outdoor play for 4 and 5 years-old. All received 10 min exercise routine during recess.  PA Edu: PA curriculum for outdoor play  SES: NR  PA Env: portable play equipment to implement PE curriculum  Meal FB: planed menus to meet the nutrition regulations and standards and to increase healthy eating choices  Staff: teachers, 20 hour training on child growth and PA. Food services workers, 6 hr training by dietitians about nutrition, menu design, nutrition standards.  Parents: Monthly health education seminars on PA and nutrition, monthly newsletters, interactive internet

First Author et al., Year Study Design Intervention Focus Setting	Sample Characteristics	Intervention Description	Outcomes Measured Results (effect size)

<sup>\*</sup>All measures of association reported in the intervention results papers are included in this table.

Intx: Intervention

NS: Not significant, p-value not reported

NR: Not reported, by the study authors

+: positive/desired/favorable result based on statistical significance.

**Ø**: null result based on statistical significance.

-: negative/undesired/unfavorable result based on statistical significance.

 $+/\emptyset$ : mix of positive and null results based on statistical significance.

<sup>\*\*</sup> Multiple papers are cited in the same row when they report on the same study

## Appendix 2. PubMed Boolean Operator Search Strategy

### **Setting and Population Words:**

child care[tiab] OR childcare[tiab] OR day care[tiab] OR daycare[tiab] OR head start[tiab] OR early care[tiab] OR early education[tiab] OR early childhood education[tiab] OR early childhood program[tiab] OR preschool[tiab] OR preschools[tiab] OR nursery schools[tiab] OR prekindergarten[tiab] OR toddler[tiab] OR child[tiab] OR early childhood[tiab]

#### Intervention and Outcome Words:

healthy eating index[tiab] OR energy intake[tiab] OR consumption[tiab] OR intake[tiab] OR feeding [tiab] OR eat\*[tiab] OR calorie[tiab] OR diet[tiab] OR nutrition[tiab] OR dietary sugars[tiab] OR sweetened[tiab] OR sugar[tiab] OR carbonated beverages[tiab] OR soda pop[tiab] OR sugar sweetened beverages[tiab] OR water[tiab] OR junk food[tiab] OR snack[tiab] OR meal[tiab] OR breakfast[tiab] OR lunch[tiab] OR dinner[tiab] OR food[tiab] OR beverages[tiab] OR fruits[tiab] OR vegetables[tiab] OR healthy food[tiab] OR menus[tiab] OR physical activity[tiab] OR exercise[tiab] OR play[tiab] OR activity level[tiab] OR motor activity[tiab] OR vigorous[tiab] OR mvpa[tiab] OR physically active[tiab] OR energy expenditure[tiab] OR motor activity[tiab] OR fitness[tiab] OR physical fitness[tiab] OR physical exertion[tiab] OR sedentary[tiab] OR inactive\*[tiab] OR body composition[tiab] OR body weight[tiab] OR body weight change[tiab] OR body mass index[tiab] OR bmi[tiab] OR body fat[tiab] OR adiposity[tiab] OR growth[tiab] OR height[tiab] OR weight[tiab] OR weight gain[tiab] OR overweight[tiab] OR obese[tiab] OR obesity[tiab] OR hunger[tiab] OR skin fold[tiab] OR food security[tiab] OR food insecurity[tiab] OR hunger[tiab]

## Review Paper Search:

Yield: 3329 references on 2-12-16
Date restriction: 01-01-05 to 12-31-16

#### **Primary Paper Search:**

Yield: 280 references on 10-26-16
Date restriction: 12-01-15 to 12-31-16

Five papers were included that were published prior to 2005 that were either seminal studies in the field<sup>22, 29, 54</sup> and deemed relevant to this literature review or prior studies of more recent interventions<sup>72, 73</sup>

# Appendix 3. Outcomes included in the literature review

- Dietary intake
  - o Fruits and vegetables
  - o Food/beverage categories characterized by added sugar
  - Meal quality
  - Snack quality
  - o Energy intake
- Physical Activity
  - o Light PA
  - o Moderate PA
  - o Moderate-vigorous PA
  - o Vigorous PA
  - o Total PA
- Weight-related/body composition:
  - o BMI
  - o BMI z-score
  - % Overweight/Obese
  - Skinfold Thickness
  - o % Body Fat
  - Waist Circumference

## Appendix 4. Definitions of Intervention Components

- 1. Nutrition education for children (Nut. Ed.) generally entailed teachers or other trained professionals delivering activity-based curriculum (e.g., games, story books, songs, puppets, videos, etc.) to children in designated, regularly occurring time sessions (i.e., lessons). Teachers or other trained professionals covered topics such as food groups, the human body and digestion, nutrients, and the importance of healthy eating and active living. Some interventions included interactive activities such as food preparation and taste tests. Promotional posters and characters were frequently included.
- 2. Foods and/or beverages served during meals (Meal FB) were modified by changing the quantity or frequency of healthy or unhealthy foods and beverages provided to children at meals during the ECE day. Changes often were made to food purchasing, menu planning, food preparation and/or serving practices. Interventions modified water access, portion sizes, energy density, fat or calorie content of meals, nutrition standards, or food service style.
- 3. Foods and/or beverages served outside of meals (FB Outside Meals) were modified by changing quantity or frequency of healthy or unhealthy foods and beverages provided to children at snacks or other times during the ECE day. Examples include serving only unsweetened beverages, increasing water access, training food service staff, improving cooking equipment and increasing the availability of healthy items.
- 4. **Physical activity offered to children (***PA Offered***)** included changes in the quantity or quality of PA opportunities provided to children during the ECE day, including additional indoor or outdoor play time, structured exercise sessions led by teachers or other trained professionals, integration of PA into the academic curriculum, and/or classroom breaks. Activities included running, jumping, climbing, kicking, throwing and catching, and dancing, among others. Most of the interventions with this component included 20-30-minute daily PA sessions.
- 5. Changed made to the physical activity environment (*PA Env.*) changes involved enhancing fixed play structures (e.g., climbing walls, hammocks, tree houses) and/or portable (e.g., balls, cords or stilts) equipment and/or adding markings for activities on the playground and/or classroom.
- 6. **Physical activity education for children (***PA Ed.***)** generally entailed activity-based curriculum (e.g., games, story books, songs, puppets, etc.) aimed at teaching children about the importance of PA and fun ways to be active. Some interventions emphasized behavioral skills, goal setting and self-monitoring and some included promotional posters displayed at the ECE site.
- 7. **Screen time regulations (**Screen Time) components included education or time limits aimed at reducing watching television, playing videogames, computer and overall electronic media use.
  - Parent Engagement activities included the distribution of print educational materials (newsletters, pamphlets, recipes, posters, handouts, etc.), activities to promote PA and/or nutrition at home (e.g., PA activity cards, music CDs, DVDs), participation in workshops or

educational sessions and/or attendance at health festivals. Many interventions offered integrated child and parent educational opportunities. Active parent engagement is defined as including in-person educational sessions or meetings and passive parent engagement is defined as exposure to print-based educational materials. Comprehensive parent engagement includes a variety of activities such as interactive education seminars and workshops on PA and nutrition, family events, engagement in project management committees, and at-home activities.

8. **Wellness-Related Policy (***Policy***)** were organization or statewide policies governing nutrition and/or physical activity offerings at ECE sites. Some policies included provisions for teacher and/or staff education.

# Appendix 5. Effective Intervention Criteria

- **Effective** interventions demonstrated statistical significance (p<.05) for ≥1 SO-related outcome, and had no negative or undesirable outcomes.
- Ineffective or Null interventions did not demonstrate statistical significance for ≥1 SO-related outcome. Any studies which had combinations of null or any negative results were also included in this category.

# Appendix 6. Magnitude of Effects for Weight Status Outcomes

• Among interventions that reported significant positive weight status outcomes, the following range of magnitudes was observed:

Any Weight Outcomes	All results
BMI	-0.57 (among obese), -0.54, -0.53, -0.53, -0.31, -0.19, -0.06,
BMI z-score	-0.26, , -0.23, -0.23, -0.18, -0.15, -0.14
% Body fat	-1.9, -1.2, -0.07
Subscapular z-score	-0.22
Sum of 4 skinfolds	-2.78mm
WC	-1.0, -0.8

## Appendix 7. Definitions and Acronyms

**BMI Z-Score**: also called BMI standard deviation (s.d.) scores, is the number of standard deviations from the mean and area measures of relative weight adjusted for child age and sex<sup>79</sup>

Body Mass Index (BMI): a person's weight in kilograms divided by their height squared in meters

CACFP: Child and Adult Care Food Program

**CCC(s):** Childcare center(s)

**Duration:** The length of time the intervention was implemented

**Early Care and Education (ECE):** Early Care and Education interventions focused on infants and children aged 0-5; intervention locations may include centers, preschools, Head Start, and/or family child care homes. Interventions in ECE may also focus on adults as appropriate for the setting, e.g. childcare providers, pre-school teachers, aides, afterschool program leads, etc.)<sup>80</sup>

FB: Food and/or Beverage

Follow-up(s): Length of time between the baseline and follow-up measurement(s)

FVs: Fruits and Vegetables

Intervention (Intx): A change in an exposure, either assigned by an investigator or naturally occurring

MPA: Moderate PA

MVPA: Moderate to vigorous PA

NA: Not applicable

NR: Not reported

**Overweight**: BMI at or above the 85<sup>th</sup> percentile for weight and height, and below the 95<sup>th</sup> percentile for children of the same age and sex<sup>81</sup>

**Obese**: BMI at or above the 95<sup>th</sup> percentile for weight and height for children of the same age and sex<sup>81</sup>

**PA:** Physical activity

**Percent (%) Body Fat:** Total mass of fat (adipose tissue) divided by the total body mass, multiplied by 100

**RCT:** Randomized-controlled trial

**Subscapular skinfold z-score:** Z-score for measure of body fat, specifically the thickness of a skinfold in the subscapular area

**Sugar-sweetened beverages (SSBs):** Drinks with added sugar, including non-diet soft drinks/sodas, flavored juice drinks, sports drinks, sweetened tea and coffee, energy drinks and sweetened milks or milk alternatives.<sup>4</sup>

**Sum of four (4) skinfolds:** Measure of body fat based on the thickness of a skinfold in four different locations on the body (locations vary by study)

**VPA:** Vigorous PA

**WC**: Waist circumference, a measure of abdominal adiposity

Weight Status: Any body weight or body composition measure; including BMI, WC, skinfold, etc.

**WG(s):** Whole grain(s)